



VOLUME 59

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

The International Criminal
Tribunal for Rwanda
2015

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)
Victoria Häberle (assistant editor)

I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. BACKGROUND	1
B. TRIAL JUDGEMENT	4
C. THE APPEALS	8
II. STANDARD OF APPELLATE REVIEW	10
III. COMMON GROUNDS OF APPEAL ON FAIRNESS OF THE PROCEEDINGS	13
A. ARREST AND INITIAL APPEARANCE (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 2; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.2; NTEZIRYAYO GROUND 9 IN PART; NDAYAMBAJE GROUND 15 IN PART).....	13
1. Nyiramasuhuko's Arrest and Initial Appearance.....	13
2. Ntahobali's Initial Appearance	16
3. Nteziryayo's Arrest and Initial Appearance	19
4. Ndayambaje's Arrest and Initial Appearance.....	21
B. JOINDER OF TRIALS (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUNDS 1 IN PART AND 4; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.4)23	
1. Applicable Law	24
2. Joinder Decision.....	26
(a) "Same Transaction" Requirement.....	26
(b) Factors Weighing in Favour of Joinder and Rights of the Accused	30
(c) Alleged Bias	32
3. Decision Denying Severance	34
4. Order for Cross-Examination and Presentation of Defence Cases	38
5. Conclusion	40
C. REPLACEMENT OF JUDGE MAQUTU (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 5; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.6; NDAYAMBAJE GROUND 16)	42
1. Reconsideration of the Appeal Decision on Continuation of Trial.....	43
2. Decisions Denying the Recall of Witnesses	46
(a) 6 May 2004 Decision on Nyiramasuhuko Motion to Recall Witnesses.....	46
(b) 29 June 2004 Decision	50
(c) 6 May 2004 Decisions on Ndayambaje Motions to Recall Witnesses QAQ and QAR.....	52
3. Alleged Errors in the Trial Judgement.....	54
4. Conclusion	57
D. ADDITION OF WITNESSES TO THE PROSECUTION'S WITNESS LIST (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 10; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.11).....	58
E. PRESENCE OF PROSECUTION WITNESSES IN THE COURTROOM DURING OBJECTIONS (NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.9; NDAYAMBAJE GROUND 14)	65
F. CROSS-EXAMINATION OF PROSECUTION WITNESS TA (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 12 IN PART; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.5 IN PART)	67
G. REFUSAL TO RECALL WITNESSES (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 7 IN PART; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.5 IN PART).....	71
1. 3 March 2006 Decision.....	72
2. 20 November 2008 Decision	74
3. 9 December 2008 Decision on Motion to Recall Witness TK.....	77
4. 24 February 2009 Oral Decision.....	79
5. Conclusion	83
H. NSABIMANA'S STATEMENTS (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUNDS 4 AND 19 IN PART; NTAHOBALI GROUND 3.9 IN PART; NSABIMANA GROUNDS 6 IN PART AND 7).....	84
1. Exhibits P113 and P114.....	85
2. Exhibit P185.....	93
3. 1996 Telephone Conversations.....	95
4. Conclusion	96

I. PARTICIPATION OF A FORMER PROSECUTION LEGAL OFFICER IN THE PREPARATION OF THE TRIAL JUDGEMENT (NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.8; NDAYAMBAJE GROUND 13).....	97
J. ALLEGATIONS OF FALSE TESTIMONY AND CONTEMPT (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 7 IN PART; NTAHOBALI GROUNDS 1.3 AND 3.12; KANYABASHI GROUND 3.11)	99
1. Procedural Background.....	99
2. <i>Amici Curiae</i> Reports.....	103
(a) Communication of the <i>Amici Curiae</i> Reports	103
(i) First <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Report	106
(ii) Second <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Reports	107
a. Second <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Report Concerning Witness QA	108
b. Second <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Report Concerning Witnesses QY and SJ	109
(b) Failure to Consider the Impact of the <i>Amici Curiae</i> Reports	114
3. Failure to Exclude Evidence and Apply the Requisite Caution.....	116
4. Conclusion	121
K. RIGHT TO BE TRIED WITHOUT UNDUE DELAY (NYIRAMASUHUKO GROUND 1 IN PART; NTAHOBALI GROUND 1.1; NTEZIRYAYO GROUND 9; KANYABASHI GROUND 6; NDAYAMBAJE GROUND 15 IN PART)	123
1. Length of the Delay, Complexity of the Proceedings, and Conduct of the Parties and Relevant Authorities	125
2. Prejudice	138
3. Remedy	140
4. Conclusion	142
IV. APPEAL OF PAULINE NYIRAMASUHUKO	143
A. FAIRNESS OF THE PROCEEDINGS (GROUNDS 8, 9, 11, AND 12 IN PART)	144
1. Appearance of Bias (Ground 8)	144
2. Expert Witness Guichaoua’s Report and Testimony (Ground 9).....	146
(a) Admission of the Guichaoua Report	148
(b) Expert Witness Guichaoua’s Testimony.....	151
(c) Conclusion.....	152
3. Undue Limitation of Prosecution Witnesses Cross-Examinations (Ground 11).....	153
4. Disclosure of Evidence (Ground 12 in part).....	153
(a) Disclosure of Names of the Prosecution Witnesses’ Parents	154
(b) Disclosure of Statements of Former RPA Members	155
(c) Conclusion.....	155
B. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 3, 14-18, AND 26 IN PART)	156
1. Amendment of the Indictment (Ground 3)	156
(a) Leave to Amend the Indictment	158
(b) Dismissal of Requests for Additional Information	160
2. Conspiracy to Commit Genocide (Ground 18).....	162
3. Butare Prefecture Office (Grounds 14 to 17).....	171
(a) Killings	173
(b) Rapes	176
(c) Superior Responsibility	185
(d) Conclusion	191
4. Distribution of Condoms (Ground 26 in part)	192
5. Cumulative Effect of the Defects (Ground 14).....	194
6. Conclusion	196
C. FABRICATION OF EVIDENCE AND GENOCIDE SURVIVOR GROUPS (GROUND 13)	198
D. CONSPIRACY TO COMMIT GENOCIDE (GROUND 19).....	200
1. Appearance of Bias	201
2. Reliance on Nyiramasuhuko’s Testimony	203
3. Expert Evidence	204
4. 27 April Directive	207

5. Nsabimana's Swearing-In Ceremony	210
(a) Kambanda's and Sindikubwabo's Speeches	211
(i) Ntakirutimana Reports	211
(ii) Expert Witnesses Des Forges and Reyntjens	213
(iii) Expert Witness Shimamungu	215
(iv) Witness RV	216
(v) Interpretation of the Speeches	218
(b) Commencement of the Widespread Killings in Butare Prefecture	220
6. Incoherent and Contradictory Findings	222
7. Conclusion	229
E. ALIBIS (GROUNDS 20-22)	230
1. Notice of Alibi	230
2. Assessment of Alibi Evidence	233
(a) Alibi for 14 to 16 May 1994	234
(b) Alibis for Early June to 19 June 1994	238
(i) Reversal of the Burden of Proof	240
(ii) Nyiramasuhuko's Evidence	240
(iii) Other Defence Evidence	246
a. Witness Denise Ntahobali	246
b. Witness Clarisse Ntahobali	249
c. Witness Edmond Babin	250
3. Conclusion	252
F. BUTARE PREFECTURE OFFICE (GROUNDS 23-25, 28-31)	253
1. Imprecise and Improper Findings	253
(a) Killings	253
(b) Rapes	262
(c) Conclusion	265
2. Assessment of Evidence	265
(a) Unpleaded and Prejudicial Evidence	266
(b) Collusion	271
(c) Identification Evidence	274
(i) In-Court Identification	274
(ii) Prior Knowledge	275
a. Witness SU	276
b. Witness SD	277
c. Witness SS	278
d. Witness SJ	281
(iii) Identification at the Butare Prefecture Office	282
a. Witness TA	282
b. Witness QJ	285
c. Witness TK	286
d. Witness RE	289
e. Witness FAP	291
f. Witness QY	293
g. Witness QBQ	294
(iv) Conclusion	297
(d) Mid-May Attack	298
(e) Night of Three Attacks	307
(i) Timing and Number of Attacks	308
(ii) Failure to Consider Witness TA's and SD's Evidence	314
(iii) Abductions of Mbasha's Wife and Children and of Unnamed Woman and Children ...	315
a. Same Attack	316
b. Mbasha's Wife and Children	319
c. Unnamed Woman and Children	323

(iv) Nyiramasuhuko's Presence, Conduct, and Orders to Commit Rapes.....	324
(v) Trifina	329
(vi) Killing Locations and Abductions of Semanyenzi	332
(vii) Conclusion	335
(f) First Half of June Attacks	335
3. Ordering Responsibility	341
4. Superior Responsibility	348
(a) Superior-Subordinate Relationship and Effective Control over the <i>Interahamwe</i>	349
(b) Superior Responsibility for Direct Participation in a Crime	355
(c) Conclusion	355
5. Conclusion	356
G. DISTRIBUTION OF CONDOMS (GROUNDS 26 IN PART AND 27).....	357
1. Assessment of Evidence	358
2. Nyiramasuhuko's Genocidal Intent	363
3. Conclusion	365
V. APPEAL OF ARSÈNE SHALOM NTAHOBALI.....	366
A. FAIRNESS OF THE PROCEEDINGS.....	367
1. Amendment of the Rules (Ground 1.7).....	367
2. Admissibility of Documentary Evidence (Ground 1.10).....	371
3. Suspension of Lead Investigator (Ground 1.12).....	372
4. Cumulative Effect of the Violations (Ground 1.13)	376
B. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 2.1 TO 2.7)	378
1. Amendment of the Indictment (Ground 2.6)	378
2. Institut de Recherche Scientifique et Technique (Ground 2.1).....	381
(a) Whether the Defects Were Curable.....	382
(b) Whether the Defects Were Cured	386
(c) Conclusion.....	395
3. Hotel Ihuliro Roadblock (Ground 2.2 in part)	395
(a) Committing Killings.....	397
(b) Ordering the Killing of Léopold Ruvurajabo.....	401
(c) Committing the Rape of a Tutsi Girl.....	404
4. Killing of the Rwamukwaya Family (Ground 2.3).....	409
(a) Whether the Defects Were Curable	410
(b) Whether the Defects Were Cured	413
(c) Conclusion.....	419
5. Butare Prefecture Office (Ground 2.5 in part).....	419
(a) Killings	420
(b) Rapes.....	425
6. École Évangéliste du Rwanda (Ground 2.4 in part)	432
(a) Whether the Indictment Was Defective	434
(b) Whether the Defects Were Cured	438
(c) Conclusion.....	440
7. Superior Responsibility (Grounds 2.2, 2.4 and 2.5 in part).....	441
(a) Identification of Subordinates	442
(b) Criminal Conduct of Subordinates.....	446
(c) Knowledge of the Subordinates' Criminal Conduct	446
(d) Failure to Prevent or Punish.....	448
(e) Conclusion.....	449
8. Cumulative Effect of the Defects (Ground 2.7).....	449
9. Conclusion	453
C. EXPERT WITNESS GUICHAOUA'S STATUS AND EVIDENCE (GROUND 3.7)	455
D. ADMISSION AND ASSESSMENT OF CO-ACCUSED'S EVIDENCE (GROUND 3.10).....	456
E. ALIBIS (GROUND 3.11).....	458

1. Alibi for Late April to Early May 1994.....	459
2. Alibi for 26 or 27 May to 5 June 1994.....	463
3. Conclusion	468
F. INSTITUT DE RECHERCHE SCIENTIFIQUE ET TECHNIQUE (GROUNDS 3.1 AND 4.5)	469
1. Assessment of Evidence	469
(a) Inconsistencies and Insufficient Caution.....	470
(b) Identification Evidence	475
(c) Exculpatory Evidence	478
(d) Additional Evidence Admitted on Appeal	480
(e) Conclusion.....	483
2. Ordering Responsibility	483
3. Conclusion	485
G. HOTEL IHULIRO ROADBLOCK (GROUNDS 3.2, 3.3, AND 4.2, 4.3 IN PART).....	486
1. Imprecise and Unsupported Findings	487
2. Date of Establishment of the Roadblock	491
(a) Evidence Relied Upon by the Trial Chamber	492
(b) Failure to Consider Defence Evidence.....	494
(c) Evidence on UNAMIR’s Departure.....	497
(d) Defence Evidence and Reversal of Burden of Proof	498
(e) Conclusion.....	502
3. Killing of Léopold Ruvurajabo.....	502
(a) Assessment of Evidence.....	502
(i) Insufficient Caution	502
(ii) Prior Inconsistent Statement	505
(iii) Identification Evidence.....	507
(iv) Failure to Consider Evidence.....	507
(v) Contradictory Findings	509
(vi) Additional Evidence Admitted on Appeal	511
(vii) Conclusion	512
(b) Superior Responsibility.....	512
(c) Conclusion.....	516
4. Rape and Murder of a Tutsi Girl.....	516
(a) Inconsistencies	517
(b) Identification Evidence	522
(c) Conclusion.....	525
5. Conclusion	525
H. KILLING OF THE RWAMUKWAYA FAMILY (GROUNDS 3.4 AND 4.7).....	526
I. BUTARE PREFECTURE OFFICE (GROUNDS 3.6, 3.9 IN PART, 4.2-4.4).....	530
1. Imprecise and Unsupported Findings	530
(a) Killings.....	532
(i) 19 April to Mid-May Attacks	532
(ii) Last Half of May Attacks	533
(iii) Night of Three Attacks and First Half of June Attacks	535
(b) Rapes.....	540
(c) Conclusion.....	547
2. Assessment of the Evidence.....	548
(a) General Challenges	550
(i) Reversal of the Burden of Proof.....	550
(ii) Unpleaded and Prejudicial Evidence	551
(iii) Rejection of Admissible Evidence	554
(iv) Inference of Trauma.....	555
(v) Expert Evidence	557
(vi) Exculpatory Evidence	558
(b) Identification Evidence	561

(i) General Challenges	562
a. Hearsay Evidence	562
b. Identification Parade and In-Court Identification	565
(ii) Mid-May Attack and Last Half of May Attacks	567
(iii) Night of Three Attacks	574
a. Witnesses TK and SJ	575
i. Witness TK	575
ii. Witness SJ	577
b. Abduction of Mbasha's Wife and Children	579
c. The Vehicle	585
(iv) Conclusion	591
(c) Mid-May Attack and Last Half of May Attacks	591
(i) Mid-May Attack	592
(ii) Last Half of May Attacks	596
(iii) Contradictory Findings and Evidence	602
(iv) Additional Credibility Challenges	606
(v) Conclusion	613
(d) Night of Three Attacks	613
(i) Timing of the Night of Three Attacks	614
(ii) Credibility and Reliability of Prosecution Witnesses	617
a. Witnesses QY and SJ	617
b. Witness QBQ	619
c. Witness FAP	623
d. Witnesses SS and SU	626
e. Witness RE	633
(iii) Failure to Consider Witnesses TA's and SD's Evidence	634
(iv) Abduction of Mbasha's Wife and Children	636
(v) Other Abductions	641
(vi) General Inconsistencies	645
(vii) Conclusion	647
(e) First Half of June Attacks	647
(i) Rapes of Witness TA	647
(ii) Killings	653
(iii) Conclusion	658
(f) Number of Refugees Abducted and Killed	658
3. Ordering Responsibility	661
(a) Ordering Killings	662
(b) Ordering Rapes	668
(c) Conclusion	671
4. Superior Responsibility	672
(a) Imprecise Findings	673
(b) Assessment of Evidence	675
(c) Conclusion	678
5. Conclusion	679
J. ÉCOLE ÉVANGELISTE DU RWANDA (GROUNDS 3.5, 4.1, 4.2, AND 4.3 IN PART)	680
1. Imprecise Findings	680
2. Assessment of Evidence	685
(a) Reversal of Burden of Proof and Assessment of Exculpatory Evidence	685
(b) Identification Evidence	690
(i) Witness RE	690
(ii) Witness QY	693
(iii) Witness SX	696
(iv) Witness TB	698
(v) Conclusion	699

(c) Evidence Concerning Attacks	699
(i) Timing of Events and Number of Refugees	699
(ii) Presence and Involvement of Ntahobali During Attacks.....	703
a. Ntahobali's Presence During the Attack Described by Witness RE	705
b. Ntahobali's Presence During the Attack Described by Witness QY	709
c. Ntahobali's Presence During the Attacks Described by Witness SX.....	714
(iii) Killings	716
(iv) Conclusion	718
(d) Expert Evidence	718
(e) Conclusion.....	719
3. Aiding and Abetting Responsibility.....	719
(a) Absence from the Crime Scene	720
(b) Reliance on Prior Conduct	721
(c) Authority over <i>Interahamwe</i> and Soldiers	723
(d) Conclusion	725
4. Superior Responsibility.....	725
5. Conclusion	731
K. NEXUS BETWEEN CRIMES AND ARMED CONFLICT (GROUND 4.8)	732
L. CRIME OF EXTERMINATION (GROUND 4.9).....	733
M. CRIME OF PERSECUTION (GROUND 4.6).....	736
VI. APPEAL OF SYLVAIN NSABIMANA	743
A. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 1, 2, AND 11).....	744
B. NSABIMANA'S SWEARING-IN CEREMONY (GROUND 4).....	751
C. ADMISSION AND RELIANCE ON PREJUDICIAL EVIDENCE (GROUNDS 5, 6 AND 13 IN PART)	753
1. Evidence of Witnesses Not Identified As Testifying Against Nsabimana	754
2. Witness TK's Evidence of an Unpleaded Allegation	760
3. Conclusion	761
D. BUTARE PREFECTURE OFFICE (GROUNDS 6 IN PART, 7-10, 12, 13 IN PART, 14).....	762
1. <i>Actus Reus</i> (Grounds 8 to 10, and 12 in part)	762
(a) Legal Duty to Act.....	762
(b) Substantial Assistance.....	764
(c) Ability to Act.....	765
(d) Conclusion	769
2. <i>Mens Rea</i> (Grounds 6 in part, 7, 12 and 13 in part, 14).....	769
(a) Knowledge of Crimes.....	770
(i) Exhibits P113 and P114	770
(ii) Nsabimana's Testimony	772
(iii) Prosecution Evidence and Open and Notorious Nature of the Attacks	776
(iv) Conclusion	779
(b) Knowledge of Genocidal Intent of the Perpetrators.....	779
(c) Knowledge that His Failure to Act Assisted in the Commission of the Crimes	782
(d) Conclusion	784
3. Conclusion	784
VII. APPEAL OF ALPHONSE NTEZIRYAYO	785
A. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 1, 2, AND 3).....	786
1. Ndayambaje's Swearing-In Ceremony (Ground 1)	786
2. Muyaga and Kibayi Meetings (Grounds 2 and 3).....	791
(a) Muyaga Commune Meeting.....	794
(b) Kibayi Commune Meeting.....	799
3. Conclusion	804
B. NDAYAMBAJE'S SWEARING-IN CEREMONY (GROUND 4)	806
1. Assessment of Prosecution Evidence.....	806

(a) Witnesses QAQ and QAR.....	807
(b) Insufficient Caution.....	807
(c) Nteziryayo’s Words and Order of Speeches.....	810
(d) Dats.....	815
(e) Attendees.....	819
(f) Time.....	822
(g) Different Meeting.....	824
2. Assessment of Defence Evidence.....	828
3. Conclusion.....	830
C. MUYAGA COMMUNE MEETING (GROUND 5).....	831
1. Insufficient Caution.....	832
2. Timing of the Meeting.....	834
3. Identification Evidence.....	836
4. Similarities Between Prosecution and Defence Evidence.....	838
5. Nteziryayo’s Presence Elsewhere From 17 June 1994 Onwards.....	840
6. Conclusion.....	843
D. KIBAYI COMMUNE MEETING (GROUND 6).....	844
1. Insufficient Caution.....	845
2. Identification Evidence.....	847
3. Similarities and Differences Between Prosecution and Defence Evidence.....	850
4. Conclusion.....	853
E. PREJUDICIAL ASSESSMENT OF EVIDENCE (GROUNDS 7 AND 8).....	855
VIII. APPEAL OF JOSEPH KANYABASHI.....	857
A. VARIATION OF WITNESS LIST AND REOPENING OF CASE (GROUNDS 1.7, 3.9, AND 3.10).....	858
1. 15 February 2008 Decision.....	859
(a) Variation of the Witness List in Relation to Kabakobwa Hill.....	859
(b) Variation of the Witness List in Relation to the Incitement by Megaphone.....	861
2. 2 July 2008 Decision.....	865
3. 19 January 2009 Decision.....	867
4. Conclusion.....	870
B. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.7 IN PART, 3.1).....	871
1. Kabakobwa Hill (Ground 1.1).....	871
2. Matyazo Clinic (Grounds 2.1, 2.2, and 2.7 in part).....	878
(a) Dates of the Attack.....	879
(b) Superior Responsibility.....	882
3. Incitement by Megaphone (Ground 3.1).....	886
4. Conclusion.....	894
C. KABAKOBWA HILL (GROUNDS 1.2-1.7).....	896
D. MATYAZO CLINIC (GROUNDS 2.1 TO 2.6, 2.7 IN PART).....	897
E. INCITEMENT BY MEGAPHONE (GROUNDS 3.2 TO 3.8).....	902
1. Assessment of Evidence.....	902
(a) Fabrication of Evidence.....	903
(b) Exculpatory Evidence.....	908
(c) Modus Operandi.....	909
(d) Late May 1994 Megaphone Announcement.....	911
(i) Identification.....	911
(ii) Credibility.....	914
(iii) Corroboration.....	917
(iv) Reversal of Burden of Proof.....	918
(v) Relationships with Witnesses.....	922
(vi) Conclusion.....	923
(e) Mid-June 1994 Megaphone Announcement.....	925
(i) Identification.....	925

(ii) Credibility	926
(iii) Reversal of Burden of Proof	928
(iv) Conclusion	929
(f) Killings	930
(g) Conclusion	931
2. Criminal Responsibility	932
3. Conclusion	935
IX. APPEAL OF ÉLIE NDAYAMBAJE.....	936
A. INDICTMENT (GROUNDS 1 TO 6).....	937
1. Mugombwa Church (Grounds 1, 2, and 6 in part).....	937
(a) Location, Dates, and Participation in the Attacks	939
(b) Aiding and Abetting Responsibility.....	944
(c) Direct and Public Incitement to Commit Genocide	947
2. Kabuye Hill (Grounds 5, and 6 in part)	953
(a) Interception at Ngiryi Bridge and Forced Return to Gisagara	955
(b) Transportation of Attackers	957
(c) Distribution of Weapons	958
(d) Authority Over Unidentified Attackers.....	959
(e) Responsibility for Aiding and Abetting	960
3. Ndayambaje's Swearing-In Ceremony (Grounds 3, and 6 in part)	962
(a) Whether the Defect Was Curable	965
(b) Whether the Defect Was Cured	967
4. Abduction of Tutsi Women and Girls in Mugombwa (Grounds 4, and 6 in part).....	973
(a) Whether the Defect Was Curable.....	975
(b) Whether the Defect Was Cured	975
5. Conclusion	982
B. BIAS (GROUND 8).....	983
C. ALIBI (GROUND 7).....	988
1. Notice of Alibi	988
2. Reversal of the Burden of Proof	994
3. Assessment of Alibi Evidence	997
(a) Failure to Consider Evidence	998
(b) Relationships with Alibi Witnesses	1000
(c) Assessment of the Alibi Evidence.....	1001
(i) Ndayambaje	1001
(ii) Witness Tiziano	1004
(iii) Witness Stan	1007
(iv) Witness MARVA.....	1010
(v) Witness GABON	1012
(vi) Witness KEPIR	1013
4. Conclusion	1015
D. DENIAL OF SITE VISITS (GROUND 12)	1016
E. MUGOMBWA CHURCH (GROUNDS 9 IN PART, AND 17).....	1020
1. Assessment of Witness QAR's Evidence	1021
(a) Presence of Ndayambaje at Mugombwa Church	1021
(b) Identification under Difficult Circumstances.....	1025
(c) Inconsistencies and Contradictions within Witness QAR's Evidence.....	1027
2. Contradictions in Prosecution Evidence.....	1031
3. Lack of Corroboration.....	1034
4. Assessment of Defence Evidence	1038
(a) Witness JAMES	1038
(b) Witness MAJK.....	1039
(c) Witness BOZAN	1041

5. Conclusion	1044
F. KABUYE HILL (GROUNDS 9 IN PART, 10, 11, 18).....	1045
1. Interception of Tutsi Refugees at Ngiryi Bridge on 20 April 1994 and Attack on Kabuye Hill on 22 April 1994	1046
2. Attacks on Kabuye Hill on 23 and 24 April 1994	1050
(a) Assessment of Prosecution Evidence	1051
(i) Witness QAQ	1051
(ii) Witness RT	1054
(iii) Witness TW	1059
(iv) Witness TP	1061
(v) Witness QAL	1061
(vi) Witnesses RV and FAU	1064
(vii) Witness EV	1068
(b) Assessment of Defence Evidence	1069
3. Additional Evidence Admitted on Appeal.....	1074
4. Conclusion	1078
G. NDAYAMBAJE’S SWEARING-IN CEREMONY (GROUND 19).....	1079
1. Assessment of Prosecution Evidence.....	1079
(a) Insufficient Caution.....	1080
(b) Witness FAL	1082
(c) Witness FAG	1085
(d) Witness QAF.....	1089
(e) Witness RV	1090
(f) Witness FAU	1092
(g) Witness TO	1094
(h) Witness TP	1098
(i) Witness QAL	1102
(j) Date	1107
2. Assessment of Defence Evidence	1109
3. Imprecise and Unsupported Findings	1115
4. Conclusion	1117
H. ABDUCTION OF TUTSI WOMEN AND GIRLS IN MUGOMBWA (GROUND 20).....	1118
1. Assessment of Prosecution Evidence.....	1119
(a) Absence of Corroboration	1119
(b) Credibility of Prosecution Witnesses	1124
2. Assessment of Defence Evidence	1129
(a) Witnesses JAMES and BOZAN	1130
(b) Witness MUZIK.....	1133
(c) Witnesses ANGES, Stan, and Ndayambaje	1134
3. Criminal Responsibility	1135
4. Conclusion	1138
X. APPEAL OF THE PROSECUTION	1140
A. CRIME OF GENOCIDE (GROUND 1).....	1143
1. Committing Responsibility	1143
2. Instigating Responsibility	1145
3. Aiding and Abetting Responsibility.....	1146
B. CRIME OF DIRECT AND PUBLIC INCITEMENT TO COMMIT GENOCIDE (GROUND 2).....	1150
1. Committing Responsibility	1150
2. Aiding and Abetting Responsibility.....	1151
C. CONCLUSION	1155
XI. SENTENCING APPEALS	1156
A. NYIRAMASUHUKE’S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUND 32).....	1157

1. Aggravating Circumstances	1157
2. Mitigating Circumstances	1161
3. Life Sentence	1162
4. Conclusion	1163
B. NTAHOBALI'S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUND 5)	1164
1. Gravity of the Offences	1164
2. Aggravating Circumstances	1165
3. Mitigating Circumstances	1168
4. Comparability of Sentences	1170
5. Life Sentence	1171
6. Conclusion	1172
C. NSABIMANA'S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUNDS 15 AND 16)	1173
1. Aggravating Circumstances	1173
2. Mitigating Circumstances	1174
3. Form and Degree of Participation in the Crimes	1176
4. Conclusion	1177
D. NTEZIRYAYO'S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUNDS 10 AND 11)	1178
1. Gravity of the Offences	1178
2. Aggravating Circumstances	1179
3. Mitigating Circumstances	1180
4. Proportionality of Sentence	1183
5. Comparability of Sentences	1184
6. Conclusion	1185
E. KANYABASHI'S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUND 8)	1186
1. Gravity of the Offences	1186
2. Aggravating Circumstances	1187
3. Mitigating Circumstances	1189
4. Proportionality of Sentence	1191
5. Conclusion	1192
F. NDAYAMBAJE'S SENTENCING APPEAL (GROUND 21)	1193
1. Aggravating Circumstances	1193
2. Mitigating Circumstances	1196
3. Degree of Participation in the Crimes	1198
4. Comparability of Sentences	1200
5. Life Sentence	1200
6. Conclusion	1201
XII. IMPACT OF THE APPEALS CHAMBER'S FINDINGS ON SENTENCES	1202
A. NYIRAMASUHUKO	1202
B. NTAHOBALI	1202
C. NSABIMANA	1204
D. NTEZIRYAYO	1204
E. KANYABASHI	1205
F. NDAYAMBAJE	1206
XIII. DISPOSITION	1208
XIV. PARTIALLY DISSENTING OPINION OF JUDGE POCAR	1215
XV. JOINT DISSENTING OPINION OF JUDGE POCAR AND JUDGE AGIUS	1217
1. Kanyabashi Indictment: Mid-June 1994 Incident	1218
2. Assessment of the Evidence: Late May 1994 Incident	1220
3. Conclusion	1222

XVI. DISSENTING AND SEPARATE OPINIONS OF JUDGE AGIUS	1224
A. DISSENTING OPINION: NDAYAMBAJE’S AND NTEZIRYAYO’S ARREST AND INITIAL APPEARANCE.....	1224
1. Ndayambaje’s Arrest and Initial Appearance	1224
(a) The Issue of Waiver	1225
(i) Whether Ndayambaje failed to raise the issues at trial	1226
(ii) Whether the Appeals Chamber should nevertheless consider Ndayambaje’s submissions.....	1229
(b) Conclusion	1232
2. Nteziryayo’s Arrest and Initial Appearance	1232
B. DISSENTING OPINION: THE CRIME OF PERSECUTION AS A CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY	1235
C. SEPARATE OPINION: AIDING AND ABETTING.....	1240
D. DISSENTING OPINION: SENTENCING.....	1240
1. Ntahobali’s Appeal on the Gravity of the Offences in Sentencing.....	1240
2. Impact of the Appeals Chamber’s Findings on Nyiramasuhuko’s, Ntahobali’s, and Ndayambaje’s Sentences.....	1241
XVII. PARTIALLY DISSENTING AND DISSENTING OPINIONS OF JUDGE LIU	1243
A. PARTIALLY DISSENTING OPINION: LEAVE TO AMEND INDICTMENT	1243
B. DISSENTING OPINION: NTAHOBALI’S RESPONSIBILITY AT THE BUTARE PREFECTURE OFFICE	1245
1. Ordering Responsibility for Killings at the Mid-May Attack.....	1245
2. Superior Responsibility.....	1246
C. PARTIALLY DISSENTING OPINION: SENTENCING	1250
1. Double-Counting Nyiramasuhuko’s Abuse of Authority.....	1250
2. Consideration of Argument in Gravity of Offences	1251
XVIII. DISSENTING OPINION AND DECLARATION OF JUDGE KHAN	1253
A. DISSENTING OPINION: NTAHOBALI’S RESPONSIBILITY AT THE BUTARE PREFECTURE OFFICE.....	1253
1. The Trial Chamber Convicted Ntahobali for Ordering Killings in Relation to These Attacks.....	1253
2. The Absence of a Reasoned Opinion Does Not Invalidate the Verdict.....	1255
3. The Scope of Ntahobali’s Liability in Relation to These Attacks	1256
4. The Record Sustains Ntahobali’s Convictions for Ordering Killings During These Attacks.....	1257
5. The Record Sustains Ntahobali’s Superior Responsibility for Killings During These Attacks.....	1261
6. Number of Refugees Abducted and Killed	1261
B. DECLARATION: JOINDER.....	1262
1. Examining the Theoretical Justifications for Joinder	1263
2. Considering Joinder in the Future.....	1268
XIX. ANNEX A: PROCEDURAL HISTORY	1270
A. BRIEFING.....	1270
1. Notices of Appeal	1270
2. Appeal Briefs	1272
3. Response Briefs	1273
4. Reply Briefs	1274
B. ASSIGNMENT OF JUDGES	1275
C. STATUS CONFERENCE.....	1275
D. MOTIONS FOR STAY OF THE PROCEEDINGS, PROVISIONAL RELEASE, AND SEVERANCE	1276
E. MOTIONS FOR THE ADMISSION OF ADDITIONAL EVIDENCE ON APPEAL.....	1276
F. APPEALS HEARING.....	1277

XX. ANNEX B: CITED MATERIALS AND DEFINED TERMS..... 1278

- A. JURISPRUDENCE 1278
 - 1. Tribunal..... 1278
 - 2. International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY)..... 1291
 - 3. International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunals 1296
 - 4. Human Rights Committee..... 1296
 - 5. African Commission on Human and People’s Rights 1296
 - 6. Inter-American Court of Human Rights 1296
 - 7. European Court of Human Rights..... 1296
- B. DEFINED TERMS 1297
 - 1. Acronyms and Abbreviations 1297
 - 2. Filings of the Parties 1302