



V O L U M E 57

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

The International
Criminal Court
2011–2012

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)
Victoria Häberle (assistant editor)

CONTENTS

Contents	5
Preface	9
 Applications for Interim Release / Circumstances of Detention	
Judgment on the appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the decision of Trial Chamber III of 27 June 2011 entitled “Decision on Applications for Provisional Release”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05–01/08 OA 7, A. Ch., 19 August 2011	11
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka	30
Judgment on the appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the decision of Trial Chamber III of 2 September 2011 entitled “Decision on the ‘Demande de mise en liberté de M. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo afin d’accomplir ses devoirs civiques en République Démocratique du Congo’”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05–01/08 OA 8, A. Ch., 9 September 2011	35
Separate Opinion of Judge Song	46
Review of Detention and Decision on the “Third Defence request for Interim release”, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10, P.T. Ch. I, 16 September 2011	47
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the Decision of Trial Chamber III of 26 September 2011 entitled “Decision on the accused’s application for provisional release in light of the Appeals Chamber’s judgement of 19 August 2011”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05–01/08 OA 9, A. Ch., 15 December 2011	63
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo against the Decision of Trial Chamber III of 6 January 2012 entitled “Decision on the defence’s 28 December 2011 ‘Requête de Mise en liberté provisoire de M. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo’”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05–01/08 OA 10, A. Ch., 5 March 2012	79
Commentary <i>Michail Vagias</i>	90
 Admissibility	
Judgment on the Appeal of the Republic of Kenya against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 30 May 2011 entitled – “Decision on the Application by the Government of Kenya Challenging the Admissibility of the Case Pursuant to Article 19(2)(b) of the Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA, A. Ch., 30 August 2011	97
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka	125
Commentary <i>Craig Eggett</i>	136
 Issues relating to Counsel	
Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II dated 20 July 2011 entitled “Decision with Respect to the Question of Invalidating the Appointment of Counsel to the Defence”, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura, Kenyatta and Ali</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11 OA 3, A. Ch., 10 November 2011	141
Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the decision of Trial Chamber IV of 30 June 2011 entitled “Decision on the Prosecution’s Request to Invalidate the Appointment of Counsel to the Defence”, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09 OA, A. Ch., 11 November 2011	157
Commentary <i>Michael Karnavas</i>	166

Legal Assistance for Accused

Decision reviewing the Registry’s decision on legal assistance for Mr Thomas Lubanga Dyilo pursuant to Regulation 135 of the Regulations of the Registry, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06, T. Ch. I, 30 August 2011 179

Decision on the “Registrar’s Submissions under Regulation 24bis of the Regulations of the Court in Relation to Trial Chamber’ I’s Decision ICC-01/04–01/06–2800” of 5 October 2011, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06 OA 20, A. Ch., 21 November 2011 193

Commentary *Kevin Crow* 200

Authorisation of Investigation

Decision Pursuant to Article 15 of the Rome Statute on the Authorisation of an Investigation into the Situation in the Republic of Côte d’Ivoire, *Situation in the Republic of Côte d’Ivoire*, Case No. ICC-02/11, P.T. Ch. III, 3 October 2011 203

Judge Fernández de Gurmendi’s Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion 247

Commentary *Robert Heinsch* 260

Jurisdiction and State Cooperation

Decision on the “Defence Challenge to the Jurisdiction of the Court”, *Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana*, Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10, P.T. Ch. I, 26 October 2011 271

Decision on the “Corrigendum of the challenge to the jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court on the basis of articles 12(3), 19(2), 21(3), 55 and 59 of the Rome Statute filed by the Defence for President Gbagbo (ICC-02/11–01/11–129)”, *Prosecutor v. Gbagbo*, Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 15 August 2012 287

Corrigendum to the Decision pursuant to article 87(7) of the Rome Statute on the failure by the Republic of Malawi to comply with the Cooperation Requests Issued by the Court with Respect to the Arrest and Surrender of Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir, *Prosecutor v. Al Bashir*, Case No. ICC-02/05–01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 13 December 2011 307

Commentary *Yasmin Naqvi* 318

Procedural Issues

Decision on the translation of the Article 74 Decision and related procedural issues, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06, T. Ch. I, 15 December 2011 343

Decision on the “Observations on the ‘Directions on the submission of observations pursuant to article 19(3) of the Rome Statute and rule 59(3) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence’”, *Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang*, Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 3 OA 4, A. Ch., 20 February 2012 351

Separate Opinion of Judge Song 357

Decision on defence disclosure and related issues, *Prosecutor v. Bemba Gombo*, Case No. ICC-01/05–01/08, T. Ch. III, 24 February 2012 359

Decision on the postponement of the execution of the request for surrender of Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi pursuant to article 95 of the Rome Statute, *Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi*, Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 1 June 2012 369

Commentary *Annegret Hartig* 377

Confirmation of Charges No. 1

Decision on the Confirmation of Charges, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10, P.T. Ch. I, 16 December 2011	397
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Monageng	477
Decision on the appeal of the Prosecutor of 19 December 2011 against the “Decision on the confirmation of the charges” and, in the alternative, against the “Decision on the Prosecution’s Request for stay of order to release Callixte Mbarushimana” and on the victims’ request for participation, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10 OA 3, A. Ch., 20 December 2011	513
Reasons for “Decision on the appeal of the Prosecutor of 19 December 2011 against the ‘Decision on the confirmation of the charges’ and, in the alternative, against the ‘Decision on the Prosecution’s Request for stay of order to release Callixte Mbarushimana’ and on the victims’ request for participation” of 20 December 2011	517
Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 16 December 2011 entitled “Decision on the confirmation of charges”, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10 OA 4, A. Ch., 30 May 2012	525
Separate Opinion of Judge Fernández de Gurmendi	543
Commentary <i>Menno Dolman</i>	546

Confirmation of Charges No. 2

Decision on the Confirmation of Charges Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura, Kenyatta and Ali</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, P.T. Ch. II, 23 January 2012	567
Dissenting Opinion by Judge Kaul	640
Decision on the appeal of Mr Francis Kirimi Muthaura and Mr Uhuru Muigai Kenyatta against the decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 23 January 2012 entitled “Decision on the Confirmation of Charges Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura, Kenyatta and Ali</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 24 May 2012	665
Decision on the appeal of Mr William Samoei Ruto and Mr Joshua Arap Sang against the decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 23 January 2012 entitled “Decision on the Confirmation of Charges Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosgey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 3 OA 4, A. Ch., 24 May 2012	677
Commentary <i>Nikila Kaushik</i>	688

Issues relating to Victims / Victims’ Rights

Decision on the “Requête tendant à obtenir autorisation de participer à la procédure d’appel contre la ‘Décision relative à la confirmation des charges’ (ICC-01/04–01/10–465-Conf-tFRA)”, <i>Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/10 OA 4, A. Ch., 2 April 2012	695
Separate Opinion of Judge Song	700
Second decision on issues related to the victims’ application process, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 5 April 2012	701
Decision on the “Notification regarding the Legal Representation of Participating Victims in the Appeal Proceedings”, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura, Kenyatta and Ali</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 23 April 2012	711

Decision on the “Application of the Victims’ Representative pursuant to Article 83 of the Regulations”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto, Kosegey and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 3 OA 4, A. Ch., 23 April 2012.....	719
Decision on common legal representation, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09, T. Ch. IV, 25 May 2012.....	727
Decision on Victims’ Participation and Victims’ Common Legal Representation at the Confirmation of Charges Hearing and in the Related Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 4 June 2012.....	741
Commentary <i>Ines Peterson</i>	754
 Reparations Proceedings and Activities of the Trust Fund	
Decision on the OPCV’s request to participate in the reparations proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06, T. Ch. I, 5 April 2012.....	761
Decision granting leave to make representations in the reparations proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06, T. Ch. I, 20 April 2012.....	767
Decision on the defence request for leave to appeal the Decision establishing the principles and procedures to be applied to reparations, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06, T. Ch. I, 29 August 2012.....	773
Decision on the “Notification by the Board of Directors in accordance with Regulation 50 a) of the regulations of the Trust Fund for Victims to undertake activities in the Central African Republic”, <i>Situation in the Central African Republic</i> , No. ICC-01/05, P.T. Ch. II, 23 October 2012.....	785
Commentary <i>Editimfon Joseph Ikpai</i>	790
 Impartiality of the Prosecutor	
Decision on the Request for Disqualification of the Prosecutor, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11 OA 3, A. Ch., 12 June 2012.....	797
Commentary <i>Rosalyn Roberts</i>	810
 Contributors and Editors	 815