



**Annotated  
Leading Cases  
of International  
Criminal Tribunals**

**V O L U M E**

The International  
Criminal Tribunal  
for Rwanda 2006-2007

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	5
Preface .....	11
<b>Part 1/ Preliminary matters</b>	
1. Indictment and severance	
Decision on Aloys Ntabakuze's Interlocutory Appeal on Questions of Law Raised by the 29 June 2006 Trial Chamber I Decision on Motion for Exclusion of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 18 September 2006..	13
Decision on the Prosecutor's Application for Severance and Leave to Amend the Indictment Against Idelphonse Hategekimana, <i>Prosecutor v. Nizeyimana and Hategekimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55-I, T. Ch. 111, 25 September 2007. ....	27
Commentary <i>Eduardo Faria Coracini</i> .....	35
Part 2/ Procedural matters	
2. Disclosure	
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Relating to Disclosure Under Rule 66(B) of the Tribunal's Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 25 September 2006. ....	41
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion for Inspection of Statement of Pierre Celestin Mbonankira (Rule 66 (B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> . Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 20 September 2007. ....	47
Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i> .....	51
3. Use of statements of witnesses and accused	
Decision on Request for Subpoenas of United Nations Officials, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 6 October 2006. ....	55
Decision on "Appeal of Accused Arsène Shalom Ntahobali Against the Decision on Kanyabashi's Oral Motion to Cross-Examine Ntahobali Using Ntahobali's Statements to Prosecution Investigators in July 1997", <i>Prosecutor v. Ntahobali and Nyiramasuhuko</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-AR73, A. Ch., 27 October 2006. ....	61
Decision on the Prosecution Joint Motion for Re-Opening its Case and for Reconsideration of the 31 January 2006 Decision on the Hearing of Witness Michel Bagaragaza via Video-Link (Rules 54, 73, 73 <sup>7/1</sup> (E), and 85 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-T. T. Ch. III, 16 November 2006. ....	67

Decision on Prosecution Motion for Admission of Evidence of Rape and Sexual Assault Pursuant to Rule 92bis of the Rules; and Order for Reduction of Prosecution Witness List (Rules 92bis and 73bis (D) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 December 2006. . . . .	75
Decision on Prosecution Prospective Experts Witnesses Alison Des Forges, Andre Guichaoua and Binaifer Nowrojee (Rules 89 and 94bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 25 October 2007 _____	83
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Admission Into Evidence of Post-Arrest Interviews With Joseph Nzirorera and Mathieu Ngirumpatse (Rules 89 (C) and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 2 November 2007. . . . .	91
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Reconsideration of the Decision on Prospective Experts Guichaoua, Nowrojee and Des Forges, or for Certification (Rule 73(B)te of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III. 16 November 2007. . . . .	101
Commentary <i>Rosemary Ray fuse</i> .....	107
 4. Witness proofing	
Decision on Defence Motions to Prohibit Witness Proofing (Rule 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 15 December 2006. . . . .	117
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Regarding Witness Proofing, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.8, A. Ch., 11 May 2007. . . . .	125
Commentary <i>Stefanie Bock</i>	130
 5. Other evidentiary issues	
Decision on Ferdinand Nahima's Motion for the Translation of RTLM Tapes in Exhibit C7, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 20 November 2006. . . . .	137
Decision on Motions Relating to the Appellant Hassan Ngeze's and the Prosecution's Requests for Leave to Present Additional Evidence of Witnesses ABCI and EB, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 27 November 2006. . . . .	147
Decision on the <i>Voir Dire</i> Hearing of the Accused's <i>Curriculum Vitae</i> (Rules 2, 42 and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-T, T. Ch. III, 29 November 2006. . . . .	163
Decision on Appellant Jean-Bosco Barayagwiza's Motions for Leave to Present Additional Evidence Pursuant to Rule 115 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 8 December 2006. . . . .	167
Decision on Appeals Chamber Remand of Judicial Notice (Rules 94 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence). <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 December 2006. . . . .	181

Decision on the Prosecutor's Application to Admit Into Evidence the Transcript of the Accused's Interview as a Suspect and the Defense's Request to Hold a <i>Voir Dire</i> (Article 17 of the Statute; Rules 42, 43 and 95 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nchamihigo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-63-T, T. Ch. III, 5 February 2007. . . . .	205
Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i> . . . . .	211
 <b>6. Right to be present</b>	
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal, <i>Zigiranyirazo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-AR73, A. Ch., 30 October 2006. . . . .	219
Decision on Nsengiyumva Motion for Adjourment due to Illness of the Accused, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora. Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 17 November 2006. . . . .	229
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion for Stay of Proceedings While he is Unfit to Attend Trial or Certification to Appeal (Article 20 of the Statute, Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 July 2007. . . . .	233
Decision on Nzirorera's Interlocutory Appeal Concerning his Right to be Present at Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.10, A. Ch., 5 October 2007. . . . .	239
Commentary <i>Goreth Kyakuwa</i> . . . . .	244
 <b>7. Cooperation of States</b>	
Modalities for Presentation of a Witness, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 20 September 2006. . . . .	251
Decision on Request for Subpoena of Ami R. Mpungwe, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 October 2006. . . . .	255
Decision on Prosecution's Motion to Unseal the Transcripts of Witness WDUSA, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Nviramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T), <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-29-T), Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 1 November 2006. . . . .	259
Second Order for Further Submissions Concerning the Request for Referral of the Indictment to the Kingdom of the Netherlands, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11t6, T. Ch. III, 6 March 2007. . . . .	263
Decision on Prosecutor's Request for Referral of the Indictment to the Kingdom of the Netherlands, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11bis, T. Ch. III, 13 April 2007. . . . .	267
Decision on Prosecutor's Extremely Urgent Motion for Revocation of the Referral to the Kingdom of the Netherlands Pursuant to Rule 1 <i>Ibis</i> (F) & (G), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-11t6, T. Ch. designated under Rule 11t6, 17 August 2007. . . . .	277

Decision on the Request by Human Rights Watch for Leave to Appear as <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in the Proceedings for Referral of the Indictment Against Fulgence Kayishema to Rwanda (Rules <i>Ubis</i> and 74 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema</i> , Case no. ICTR-2001-67-I, T. Ch. III, 8 November 2007. . . . .	281
Commentary <i>Andre Klip</i> . . . . .	286
 8. Certification and reconsideration	
Decision on Request for Reconsideration of the Decision on Request for Review, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> . Case No. ICTR-96-14-R, A. Ch., 27 September 2006. . . . .	291
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen. . . . .	294
Separate Opinion of Judge Meron. . . . .	295
Decision on Motion for Reconsideration, <i>Ntabakuze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73, A. Ch., 4 October 2006. . . . .	297
Decision on Defence Motion for Certification to Appeal the Chamber's Decision on Nzirorera's <i>Ex Parte</i> Motion for Order for Interview of Defence Witnesses NZ1, NZ2 and NZ3 (Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T. T. Ch. III, 30 October 2006. . . . .	303
Decision on Request for Review, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-R, A. Ch., 6 March 2007. . . . .	307
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen. . . . .	316
Separate Opinion of Judge Meron. . . . .	317
Order Concerning the Filing of the Notice of Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Seromba</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-66-A, A. Ch.. 22 March 2007. . . . .	319
Declaration of Judge Schomburg. . . . .	322
Decision Reconsidering Exclusion of Evidence Related to Accused <i>Kabüigi</i> , <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 23 April 2007. . . . .	323
Decision on Defence Request for Certification to Appeal the Chamber's Decision Pursuant to Rule 986/s, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndindiliyimana, Bizimungu, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-T. T. Ch. 11. 24 April 2007. . . . .	333
Commentary <i>Steven W. Becker</i> . . . . .	337
 9. Fair trial (Rule <a href="#">5bis</a> of the ICTR RPE)	
Decision on Continuation of the Proceedings (Rule <a href="#">5bis</a> of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 6 March 2007. . . . .	347
Decision on Appeals Pursuant to Rule <a href="#">5bis</a> (D), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR15te.3, A. Ch., 20 April 2007. . . . .	369

Scheduling Order for the Resumption of the Trial (Rules <u>5bis</u> (F) and 54 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. <b>III</b> , 2 May 2007. . . . .	381
Decision on Motion for Disqualification of Judges, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, The Bureau, 28 May 2007. . . . .	385
Decision on "Joseph Nzirorera's Interlocutory Appeal of Decision on Obtaining Prior Statements of Prosecution Witnesses After They Have Testified", <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.9, A. Ch., 31 May 2007. . . . .	393
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Submission to Substitute Judge, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 8 June 2007. . . . .	399
Decision on Motions to Vacate Decisions, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 17 July 2007. . . . .	403
Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Yannis Naziris</i> . . . . .	409
 10. Undue delay	
Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Second Motion to Dismiss for Deprivation of his Right to Trial Without Undue Delay (Articles 19 and 20(4)(c) of the Statute of the Tribunal), <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 29 May 2007. . . . .	419
Decision on Justin Mugenzi's Motion Alleging Undue Delay and Seeking Severance, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 14 June 2007. . . . .	428
Commentary <i>Goran Sluiter</i> . . . . .	434
 <b>Part 3/ Judgement and sentencing</b>	
 11. <b>Judgements</b>	
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 20 September 2006. . . . .	439
Commentary <i>Alexander Zahar</i> . . . . .	509
Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Seromha</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-66-T, T. Ch. III, 13 December 2006_____	523
Commentary <i>Caroline Fournet</i> . . . . .	609
Judgement. <i>Ndindabahizi v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-71-A, A. Ch., 16 January 2007. . . . .	620
Commentary <i>Steven Freeland</i> . . . . .	671
Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Nzabirinda</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-77-T, T. Ch. II, 23 February 2007 . . . . T. . . . .	679
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i> . . . . .	703
Judgement, <i>Muhtmana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case "No. ICTR-95-1B-A, A. Ch., 21 May 2007. . . . .	717
Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro</i> . . . . .	781

Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Rugambarara</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-59-T, T. Ch. II, 16 November 2007. . . . .	789
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i> . . . . .	807
Judgement, <i>Simba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-07-76 -A, A. Ch., 27 November 2007. . . . .	817
Commentary <i>Fabián Raimondo</i> . . . . .	901
 <b>Part 4/ Post conviction or acquittal issues</b>	
 <b>12. Appropriate remedy and early release</b>	
Decision on Appropriate Remedy, <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 31 January 2007. . . . .	907
Decision on Appeal Against Decision on Appropriate Remedy, <i>Rwamakuba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-A, A. Ch., 13 September 2007. . . . .	927
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen. . . . .	939
Commentary <i>Piet-Hein van Kempen</i> . . . . .	941
Decision on Samuel Imanishimwe's Application for Early Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-S, Pres., 30 August 2007. . . . .	951
Commentary <i>Piet-Hein van Kempen</i> . . . . .	954
<b>Index</b> . . . . .	963
<b>Contributors and Editors</b> . . . . .	967