



V O L U M E

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

**The Special Court for
Sierra Leone 2004-2006**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
Part M Preliminary Matters	
1. Indictment	
Decision on the First Accused's Motion for Service and Arraignment on the Consolidated Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch. I, 29 November 2004.	13
Separate Concurring Opinion of Judge Bankole Thompson on Decision on the First Accused's Motion for Service and Arraignment on the Consolidated Indictment	27
Dissenting Opinion of Hon. Judge Benjamin Mutanga Itoe, Presiding Judge, on the Chamber Majority Decision Supported by Hon. Judge Bankole Thompson's Separate but Concurring Opinion, on the Motion Filed by the First Accused, Samuel Hinga Norman, for Service and Arraignment on the Second Indictment	35
Decision on Amendment of the Consolidated Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-AR73, A. Ch., 16 May 2005.	59
Commentary <i>John O'Dowd</i>	79
Part 2/ Procedural Matters	
2. Provisional Release	
Sesay Decision on Appeal Against Refusal of Bail, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-AR65, A. Ch., 14 December 2004.	89
Fofana Appeal Against Decision Refusing Bail, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-AR65, A. Ch., 11 March 2005.	99
Commentary <i>Jladassa Noorda</i>	110
3. Judicial Notice	
Fofana Decision on Appeal Against "Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence", <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR73, A. Ch., 16 May 2005.	115
Separate Opinion of Justice Robertson.....	127
Justice Ayoola's Separate Opinion	135
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch. II, 25 October 2005.	145
Commentary <i>Tjarda van der Spoel</i>	157

4. Disclosure, Confidentiality and On-Site Investigations

Decision on Joint Defence Motion on Disclosure of all Original Witness Statements, Interview Notes and Investigator's Notes Pursuant to Rules 66 and/or 68, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 4 May 2005.	163
Decision on Defence Submission Providing Evidentiary Proof of Registry's Repeated Dissemination of Confidential Documents to the Press and Public Affairs Office, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 17 October 2005.	169
Separate and Concurring Opinion Justice Julia Sebutinde.	173
Separate and Dissenting Opinion Justice R.B. Lussick.	178
Decision on Prosecution Motion for a <i>locus in quo</i> Visit to Karina, Bombali District, the Republic of Sierra Leone, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 25 October 2005.	181
Commentary <i>Thorn Dieben</i>	186

5. Witnesses

Ruling on Motion for Modification of Protective Measures for Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch. I, 18 November 2004.	195
Decision on Presentation of Witness Testimony on Moyamba Crime Base, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch. I, 1 March 2005.	207
Dissenting Opinion of Hon. Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe, Presiding Judge, on the Decision on Presentation of Witness Testimony on Moyamba Crime Base.	211
Decision on Defence Application Regarding Witness TF2-218, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch. I, 8 June 2005.	219
Dissenting Opinion of Hon. Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe on the Chamber Majority Decision on Defence Application Regarding Witness TF2-218.	223
Decision on Joint Defence Motion for General Orders Pursuant to Rule 54, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 28 July 2005.	233
Decision on Prosecution Request for Leave to Call an Additional witness (Zainab Hawa Bangura) Pursuant to Rule 73(5)(E), and on Joint Defence Notice to Inform the Trial Chamber of its Position <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Proposed Expert Witness (Mrs. Bangura) Pursuant to Rule 94bis, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 5 August 2005.	241
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Justice Doherty on Prosecution Request for Leave to Call an Additional Witness (Zainab Hawa Bangura) Pursuant to Rule 736w(E), and on Joint Defence Notice to Inform the Trial Chamber of its Position <i>vis-a-vis</i> the Proposed Expert Witness (Mrs. Bangura) Pursuant to Rule 94bis, 21 October 2005.	253
Commentary <i>Michael Moesenthin</i>	262
Decision on the Prosecution's Oral Application for Leave to be Granted to Witness TF1-150 to Testify Without Being Compelled to Answer any Questions in Cross-Examination That the Witness Declines to Answer on Grounds of Confidentiality Pursuant to Rule 70(B) and (D) of the Rules, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 16 September 2005.	271
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Doherty on the Prosecution's Oral Application for Leave to be Granted to Witness TF1-150 to Testify Without Being Compelled to Answer any Questions in Cross-Examination That the Witness Declines to Answer on Grounds of Confidentiality Pursuant to Rule 70(B) and (D) of the Rules, 22 September 2005.	277

Decision on Prosecution Appeal Against Decision on Oral Application for Witness TF1-150 to Testify Without Being Compelled to Answer Questions on Grounds of Confidentiality, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-16-AR73, T. Ch. II, A. Ch., 26 May 2006....	283
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Geoffrey Robertson, QC....	293
Decision on Prosecution Appeal Against Confidential Decision on Defence Application Concerning Witness TF2-218, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR73(B), A. Ch., 26 May 2006.	307
Commentary <i>Håkan Priman</i>	311
6. Admissibility and Presentation of Evidence	
Reasoned Majority Decision on Prosecution Motion for a Ruling on the Admissibility of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch. I, 24 May 2005...	317
Separate Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe, Presiding Judge, on the Chamber Majority Decision on Prosecution Motion for a Ruling on the Admissibility of Evidence.	327
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Pierre Boutet on Decision on Prosecution Motion for a Ruling on the Admissibility of Evidence.	341
Decision on Joint Defence Motion to Exclude all Evidence From Witness TF1-277 Pursuant to Rule 89(C) and/or Rule 95, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch. II, 24 May 2005.	349
Decision on Objection to Question put by Defence in Cross-Examination of Witness TF1-227, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 15 June 2005....	355
Decision on the Gbao and Sesay Joint Application for the Exclusion of the Testimony of Witness TF1-141, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 26 October 2005 ...	363
Decision on the Joint Defence Motion Requesting Conformity of Procedural Practice for Taking Witness Statements, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 26 October 2005.	373
Commentary <i>Erica Finkle</i>	383
7. Trial in the Presence of the Accused	
Ruling on the Issue of Non-Appearance of the First Accused Samuel Hinga Norman, the Second Accused Moinina Fofana, and the Third Accused, Allieu Kondewa at the Trial Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch. I, 1 October 2004.	391
Ruling on the Issue of the Refusal of the Accused Sesay and Kallon to Appear for Their Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 19 January 2005.	397
Commentary <i>Stijn Franken</i>	402
8. Relations With States	
Decision on Sesay Motion Seeking Disclosure of the Relationship Between Governmental Agencies of the United States of America and the Office of the Prosecutor, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 2 May 2005.	407
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Pierre Boutet on the Decision on Sesay Motion Seeking Disclosure of the Relationship Between Governmental Agencies of the United States of America and the Office of the Prosecutor.	419
Commentary <i>Goran Sluiter</i>	422

9. Counsel

Gbao - Decision on Appeal Against Decision on Withdrawal of Counsel, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-AR73, A. Ch., 23 November 2004. 427

Decision on the Confidential Joint Defence Application for Withdrawal by Counsel for Brima and Kamara and on the Request for Further Representation by Counsel for Kami, *Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu*, Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 20 May 2005. 439

Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Justice Sebutinde in the Decision on the Confidential Joint Defence Application for Withdrawal by Counsel for Brima and Kamara and on the Request for Further Representation by Counsel for Kanu, 8 August 2005. 451

Commentary *Anne-Marie de Brouwer*. 457

Decision on Brima-Kamara Application for Leave to Appeal From Decision on the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel, *Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu*, Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch. II, 5 August 2005. 465

Comment of Justice Doherty. 468

Separate and Concurring Opinion of Justice R.B. Lussick on Brima - Kamara Application for Leave to Appeal From Decision on the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel, 14 September 2005. 469

Decision on Brima-Kamara Defence Appeal Motion Against Trial Chamber II Majority Decision on Extremely Urgent Confidential Joint Motion for the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel for Alex Tamba Brima and Brima Bazy Kamara, *Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu*, Case No. SCSL-2004-16-AR73, A. Ch., 8 December 2005. 473

Separate and Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Ayoola on the Decision on Brima-Kamara Defence Appeal Motion Against Trial Chamber II Majority Decision on Extremely Urgent Confidential Joint Motion for the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel for Alex Tamba Brima and Brima Bazy Kamara. 505

Separate and Concurring Opinion of Hon. Mr. Justice George Gelaga King on Brima-Kamara Defence Appeal Motion Against Trial Chamber II Majority Decision on Extremely Urgent Confidential Joint Motion for the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel for Alex Tamba Brima and Brima Bazy Kamara. 513

Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice Robertson on the Decision on Brima-Kamara Defence Appeal Motion Against Trial Chamber II Majority Decision on Extremely Urgent Confidential Joint Motion for the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel for Alex Tamba Brima and Brima Bazy Kamara. 525

Appendix to the Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice Robertson on the Decision on Brima-Kamara Defence Appeal Motion Against Trial Chamber II Majority Decision on Extremely Urgent Confidential Joint Motion for the Re-Appointment of Kevin Metzger and Wilbert Harris as Lead Counsel for Alex Tamba Brima and Brima Bazy Kamara, 14 December 2005. 553

Decision on Application by Counsel for the Third Accused to Withdraw From the Case, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallian and Chao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 5 April 2006. 559

Commentary *Zoe Konstantopoulou*. 562

10. Contempt, False Testimony and Misconduct

Decision on the Report of the Independent Counsel Pursuant to Rules 77(C)iii and 77(D) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu*, Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 29 April 2005. 573

Decision on Defence Appeal Motion Pursuant to Rule 77(J) on Both the Imposition of Interim Measures and an Order Pursuant to Rule 77(C)iii, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-AR73, A. Ch., 23 June 2005.	583
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Emmanuel Ayoola on the Decision on Appeal Against the 10 March 2005 Oral Ruling on Allegations of Contempt.	593
Separate and Partial Dissenting Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King—	602
Decision on Joint Defence Appeal Against the Decision on the Report of the Independent Counsel Pursuant to Rule 77(C)(iii) and 77(D), <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-AR77, A. Ch., 17 August 2005.	613
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King on Joint Defence Appeal Against the Decision on the Report of the Independent Counsel Pursuant to Rule 77(C)(iii) and 77(D).	619
Separate and Concurring of Justice Geoffrey Robertson on Joint Defence Appeal Against the Decision on the Report of the Independent Counsel Pursuant to Rule 77(C)(iii) and 77(D).	623
Sentencing Judgement in Contempt Proceedings, <i>Independent Counsel v. Brima, Jalloh, Ester Kamara and Anifa Kamara</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2005-02 and SCSL-2005-03, T. Ch. I, 21 September 2005.	631
Commentary <i>Gissou Azarnia</i>	638
Judgment in Contempt Proceedings, <i>Independent Counsel v. Samura</i> , Case No. SCSL-2005-01, T. Ch. I, 26 October 2005.	647
Code of Conduct Hearing - Decision, <i>Case of Williams and Yillah</i> , Disciplinary Panel, 10 November 2005.	663
Dissenting Opinion Justice Doherty.	666
Decision on Complaint Pursuant to Article 32 of the Code of Professional Conduct for Counsel With the Right of Audience Before the Special Court for Sierra Leone, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-CCC32, Pres., 20 February 2006.	669
Commentary <i>Gideon Boas</i>	676
11. Scope of Appeal	
Decision on Prosecution Appeal Against the Trial Chamber's Decision of 2 August 2004 Refusing Leave to File an Interlocutory Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T. A. Ch., 17 January 2005.	683
Commentary <i>Marc Mackarel</i>	693
Part 3/ Judgements and Sentencing	
12. Decisions on Motions for Judgement of Acquittal	
Decision on Motions for Judgment of Acquittal Pursuant to Rule 98, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14, T. Ch. I, 21 October 2005.	699
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Bankole Thompson on Decision on Motions for Judgment of Acquittal Pursuant to Rule 98.	723
Decision on Joint Motion of the First and Second Accused to Clarify the Decision on Motions for Judgment of Acquittal Pursuant to Rule 98, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T. T. Ch. I, 3 February 2006.	729

Decisions on Defence Motions for Judgement of Acquittal Pursuant to Rule 98, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-T, T. Ch. II, 31 March 2006	733
Separate Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Julia Sebutinde	807
Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro and Miguel Angelo Lemos</i>	811
 Part 4/ Post Conviction or Acquittal Issues and Detention Matters	
13. Detention Matters	
Decision Prohibiting Visits, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14, Registrar, 8 November 2004.	821
Decision on Request to Reverse the Order of the Acting Registrar Under Rule 47(A) of the Rules of Detention of 6 June 2005, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-RD47, Pres., 29 June 2005.	835
Commentary <i>Miranda Boone</i>	841
Index	845
Contributors and Editors	851