

# Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

31 December 2020

Vol. 40 No. 1-12

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-480

## 1. ARTICLES

**Linus-Alexander Sicilianos**, Athens

Evolutionary Interpretation of the ECHR and Beyond:

Recent developments in the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights ..... 1

**Julia Hänni**, Lausanne

The Prospects of Climate Litigation before the European Court of Human Rights:

Prerequisites and Possible Challenges..... 5

**Hans-Jörg Behrens**, Berlin

Forum Shopping – A Challenge for International Human Rights Protection ..... 24

**Mikhail Galperin**, Moscow

Politicising Law or Legalising Politics? Justiciability and the ‘Political Question’ Doctrine  
in International Justice ..... 29

## 2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

**UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva**

– 19.X.20 – Child born in the Netherlands registered with the annotation “unknown nationality” /  
National legal order did not foresee to correct registration as “stateless” which would have  
allowed international protection / Right of the child to acquire nationality (Article 24 of the  
Covenant) violated / *D.Z. v. Netherlands*..... 35

– 13.III.20 – Failed search and rescue operation at sea on 11 October 2013 – over 200 people died: Event  
occurred outside the territorial waters of Malta but within its Search and Rescue (SAR)  
Zone / Jurisdiction affirmed / Communication declared inadmissible due to non-exhaustion  
of domestic remedies / *A.S. et al. v. Malta* ..... 41

– 4.XI.20 – Failed search and rescue operation at sea on 11 October 2013 – over 200 people died:  
Event occurred outside the territorial waters of Italy / Jurisdiction affirmed, based on  
factual elements such as ongoing involvement of the Maritime Rescue Coordination Centre  
in Rome after having answered the first distress call / Violation of the right to life in its  
substantive as well as its procedural aspects (Article 6 para. 1 alone and in conjunction with  
Article 2 para. 3 of the Covenant) / *A.S. et al. v. Italy* ..... 48

**International Court of Justice (ICJ), The Hague**

– 23.I.20 – Provisional measures ordered under the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of  
the Crime of Genocide in relation to the members of the Rohingya group in the territory of  
Myanmar / *The Gambia v. Myanmar* ..... 58

**Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACourtHR), Costa Rica**

– 6.II.20 – Interpretation of Article 26 ACHR (progressive development): Rights to a healthy  
environment, to adequate food, to water and to take part in cultural life / here: Violation of  
Article 26 ACHR (3:3 ratio of votes) / Far-reaching measures ordered to be accomplished  
over the next six years / *Indigenous Communities of the Lhaka Honhat (Our Land)  
Association v. Argentina* ..... 71

– 24.VI.20 – Sexual harassment and abuse in schools as a “known problem” which was “validated,  
normalized and tolerated” within a structural context by educational institutions / Victim  
committed suicide: the girl Paola, aged between 14 and 16 years, suffered serious acts of  
sexual violence perpetrated by the Vice Principal of her school / State’s lack of diligence  
in arresting the fugitive defendant, resulting in impunity / Violation of numerous human  
rights / *Guzmán Albarracín et al. v. Ecuador*..... 163

(Contents continued on 3<sup>rd</sup> cover page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

## Table of Contents Vol. 40 (2020) No. 1-12 (continued)

<b>Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACourtHR), Costa Rica</b>	
– 15.VII.20 – State’s responsibility for violations of human rights as a result of acts committed by a private enterprise which led to the death of 60 people, who included 20 children / Scope of the right to conditions of work that ensure the safety, health and hygiene of the workers in light of Article 26 ACHR (progressive development) / <i>The Workers of the Fireworks Factory in Santo Antônio de Jesus and their families v. Brazil</i> .....	203
<b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>	
– 29.V.20 – Interpretation of Article 7 ECHR ( <i>nulla poena sine lege</i> ): the use of the “blanket reference” or “legislation by reference” technique in criminalising acts or omissions is not in itself incompatible with Article 7 ECHR / <i>Advisory Opinion according to Protocol 16 rendered at the request of the Armenian Constitutional Court</i> .....	292
– 26.V.20 – Hate crime – decapitation of an Armenian military officer, G.M, with blows of an axe – committed in Hungary by an Azerbaijani military officer, R.S., who was sentenced to life imprisonment, which he served for six years in a Hungarian prison / Following R.S.’s transfer from Hungary to Azerbaijan to serve the rest of his sentence he was released upon presidential pardon, promoted to the rank of a major at a public ceremony, granted a flat and paid eight years of salary arrears / Azerbaijan violated the Convention (right to life, procedural limb; prohibition of discrimination in conjunction with the right to life) / <i>Makuchyan and Minasyan v. Azerbaijan and Hungary</i> .....	305
– 4.VIII.20 – Acid attack on open road in Tirana in 2009 causing 25 % burns on the applicant’s face and upper body / Unidentified assailant / Investigation stayed in 2010 / Given a suspicion that the attack might be gender-motivated should have caused the authorities to react with special diligence in carrying out the investigative measures / Violation of the procedural limb of the right to life (Article 2 ECHR) / <i>Tërshana v. Albania</i> .....	331
– 10.XI.20 – Pre-trial detention of journalists and managers of the daily newspaper Cumhuriyet (“The Republic”) based on mere suspicion and not on the existence of factual evidence / The applicants did not support the use of violence and terror for political ends / Violation of ECHR Article 5 § 1 (right to liberty) and Article 10 (freedom of expression) / <i>Sabuncu et al. v. Turkey</i> .....	346
– 28.IV.20 – Media Act (here applied to a TV channel) prohibits communication of any “opinion” by a newsreader in order to ensure unbiased news and political information / Use of the term “far-right” in a news programme to describe the political party <i>Jobbik</i> qualified as an “opinion” / Unforeseeable restriction of the right to freedom of expression / Violation of Article 10 ECHR / <i>ATV Zrt v. Hungary</i> .....	384
– 5.V.20 – Applicant’s removal as the chief prosecutor of the National Anticorruption Directorate before the end of her second mandate following her criticism of legislative reforms in the area of corruption / Right to fair trial and freedom of expression violated (Articles 6 § 1 and 10 ECHR) / <i>Kövesi v. Romania</i> .....	390
– 14.I.20 – Recognition and enforcement of judgments in matters of parental responsibility after abduction of a child by the mother / Political interference and long delays in Lithuania’s return of a daughter to her German father / “Procedural vagaries” contradicted the aims of international and European Union rules of child custody / Violation of the right to respect for private and family life (Article 8 ECHR) / <i>Rinau v. Lithuania</i> .....	413
<b>Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg</b>	
– 16.VII.20 – Processing of personal data / Protection provided by the EU-US Privacy Shield inadequate / Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2016/1250 pursuant to Directive 95/46/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council on the adequacy of the protection provided by the EU-US Privacy Shield is invalid / <i>Data Protection Commissioner v. Facebook Ireland Ltd and Maximilian Schrems</i> .....	448
<b>3. DOCUMENTATION</b>	
<b>European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission), Strasbourg</b>	
– 18.VI.20 – Opinion No. 981/2020: Execution of ECtHR judgments regarding cases v. Russia / Evaluation of the March 2020 draft amendments to the Russian Constitution .....	468
<b>International Commission of Jurists (ICJ), Geneva</b>	
– 1.V.20 – Declaration: “Withdrawal of States from African Court a Blow to Access to Justice in the Region” .....	478
<b>4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS</b>	
<b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>	
– 21.VIII.20 – The Court grants interim measure in the case of <i>Aleksey Navalnyy v. Russia</i> .....	478
– 24.III.20 – Risk of life imprisonment without parole and inadequate conditions of detention due to the Covid-19 pandemic in case of extradition to the USA / <i>Hafeez v. United Kingdom</i> .....	479