



ASSER PRESS

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2014

Between Pragmatism and Predictability:
Temporariness in International Law



Springer

Contents

Part I Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 1 | Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law | 3 |
| | Mónika Ambrus and Ramses A. Wessel | |
| 1.1 | Introduction | 4 |
| 1.2 | Forms of Temporariness | 5 |
| 1.2.1 | Temporary Objects | 6 |
| 1.2.2 | Temporary Subjects | 8 |
| 1.3 | International Law and Change | 9 |
| 1.3.1 | Temporary Objects and International Law | 9 |
| 1.3.2 | Temporary Subjects and International Law | 13 |
| 1.4 | Conclusion: All Relative? | 15 |
| | References | 16 |
| 2 | Temporariness and Change in Global Governance | 19 |
| | Rene Uruena | |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 20 |
| 2.2 | International Law in a Constant Present | 21 |
| 2.3 | Change and Temporariness | 26 |
| 2.3.1 | Change and Temporariness in a Global Regulatory Space | 28 |
| 2.3.2 | Thinking About Change in the Constant Present | 32 |
| 2.4 | Normative Challenges | 33 |
| 2.5 | Conclusion | 37 |
| | References | 38 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----|
| 3 | Temporary International Legal Regimes as Frames for Permanent Ones | 41 |
| | Jean Galbraith | |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 42 |
| 3.2 | Why Use Temporary International Legal Regimes? | 44 |
| 3.2.1 | Factors Favouring the Use of Temporary Regimes | 44 |
| 3.2.2 | Sources of Strength for Temporary Regimes | 47 |
| 3.3 | Temporary Regimes as Foundations for Permanent Regimes | 48 |
| 3.3.1 | Causes | 49 |
| 3.3.2 | Implications | 51 |
| 3.4 | Case Studies | 54 |
| 3.4.1 | Refugee Law | 54 |
| 3.4.2 | International Criminal Law | 58 |
| 3.4.3 | Climate Change | 61 |
| 3.5 | Conclusion | 63 |
| | References | 63 |
| 4 | The International Rule of Law Time After Time: Temporary Institutions Between Change and Continuity | 67 |
| | Sofia Ranchordás | |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 68 |
| 4.2 | The (International) Rule of Law as a Source of Legal Certainty .. | 71 |
| 4.2.1 | The Rule of Law: Here, There and Everywhere? | 71 |
| 4.2.2 | The International Rule of Law and Time | 76 |
| 4.2.3 | The International Rule of Law as a Law of Lasting Rules? .. | 78 |
| 4.3 | Temporary Rules, Institutions and Measures | 82 |
| 4.3.1 | Temporary Legislation and the Rule of Law at Home | 82 |
| 4.3.2 | International Temporary Institutions, Rules and Measures | 85 |
| 4.4 | Conclusion | 87 |
| | References | 89 |
| 5 | International Law and Time: A Reflection of the Temporal Attitudes of International Lawyers Through Three Paradigms | 93 |
| | Christian Djeffal | |
| 5.1 | International Law in Time: The Familiar Stranger | 94 |
| 5.2 | Paradigm Shifts | 96 |
| 5.2.1 | The Temporalisation of International Law | 97 |
| 5.2.2 | The Flexibilisation of International Legal Time? | 104 |
| 5.3 | General Conclusions | 115 |
| | References | 117 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----|
| 6 | (Inter)Temporal Considerations in the Interpretative Process of the VCLT: Do Treaties Endure, Perdure or Exdure? | 121 |
| | Panos Merkouris | |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 122 |
| 6.2 | Definitional Issues | 125 |
| 6.2.1 | Endurantism, Perdurantism, and Exdurantism | 125 |
| 6.2.2 | Intertemporal Law | 128 |
| 6.2.3 | Principle of Contemporaneity and Evolutive/Dynamic Interpretation | 129 |
| 6.3 | Silence Can Speak Volumes: The Lack of Explicit References to Intertemporal Considerations in the VCLT | 134 |
| 6.3.1 | Pre-VCLT Considerations on the Topic | 134 |
| 6.3.2 | Rejection of Explicit Incorporation of the Doctrine of Intertemporal Law in the VCLT: Draft Article 56 | 135 |
| 6.3.3 | Rejection of Explicit Solutions to Intertemporal Considerations Through the Backdoor of Article 31 | 137 |
| 6.4 | Points of Entry of Intertemporal Considerations in Article 31 VCLT | 139 |
| 6.4.1 | Direct Point of Entry | 139 |
| 6.4.2 | Indirect Point of Entry | 144 |
| 6.5 | Limits | 150 |
| 6.6 | Conclusion | 151 |
| | References | 152 |
| 7 | Shifting Demands in International Institutional Law: Securing the United Nations' Accountability for the Haitian Cholera Outbreak | 157 |
| | Kate Nancy Taylor | |
| 7.1 | Introduction | 158 |
| 7.2 | The Responsibility of the UN for the Cholera Outbreak | 159 |
| 7.3 | The UN's Jurisdictional Immunity | 161 |
| 7.4 | Alternative Modes of Dispute Settlement | 164 |
| 7.4.1 | The UN's Obligation to Settle Private Law Disputes | 164 |
| 7.4.2 | Would the Cholera Claims Fall Within the Scope of the UN's Liability? | 165 |
| 7.4.3 | Dispute Settlement Mechanisms in UN Peacekeeping Operations | 169 |
| 7.5 | Shifting Demands in the Law of International Organisations | 172 |
| 7.5.1 | Would a Domestic Court Be Willing to Adjudicate the Cholera Claims? | 172 |
| 7.5.2 | Elevating the Cholera Claims to an International Level | 176 |
| 7.5.3 | The Rule of Law in the UN and the Handling of the Cholera Claims | 178 |
| 7.5.4 | The Human Rights Imperative | 180 |
| 7.5.5 | Demands for the Enhanced Accountability of the UN | 183 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 7.6 | Permanent Versus <i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions | 187 |
| 7.6.1 | Theorising Permanent Solutions | 187 |
| 7.6.2 | <i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions: A Revised Role for Domestic Courts? | 189 |
| 7.7 | Conclusion | 191 |
| | References | 192 |
| 8 | Protecting Human Rights During Emergencies: Delegation, Derogation, and Deference | 197 |
| | Evan J. Criddle | |
| 8.1 | Introduction | 198 |
| 8.2 | The Resilience of Derogation Standards | 201 |
| 8.3 | Derogation Standards as Delegations | 206 |
| 8.4 | Deference for an Altruistic Regime | 212 |
| 8.5 | Conclusion | 218 |
| | References | 219 |
| 9 | Temporary Protection: Hovering at the Edges of Refugee Law | 221 |
| | Jean-François Durieux | |
| 9.1 | Introduction | 222 |
| 9.2 | Time in the International Legal Regime | 226 |
| 9.2.1 | Time as 'Attachment' | 226 |
| 9.2.2 | Time as Deadline | 227 |
| 9.2.3 | A Clash of Times | 230 |
| 9.3 | Temporary Protection in Europe, 1992–2001 | 232 |
| 9.3.1 | A Time of Crisis | 233 |
| 9.3.2 | After the Crisis | 240 |
| 9.4 | Hovering on | 244 |
| 9.5 | Conclusion: Time for a Showdown | 249 |
| | References | 252 |
| 10 | Between the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea: Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law | 255 |
| | Harro van Asselt | |
| 10.1 | Introduction | 256 |
| 10.2 | Flexibility in the United Nations Climate Change Regime | 258 |
| 10.2.1 | Delegated Law-Making | 259 |
| 10.2.2 | Scientific Input | 260 |
| 10.2.3 | Review and Amendment | 262 |
| 10.2.4 | Entry into Force, Reservations and Withdrawal | 265 |
| 10.2.5 | Differentiation | 266 |
| 10.2.6 | Implementation | 268 |
| 10.2.7 | Compliance | 269 |
| 10.2.8 | Flexibility in the Climate Change Regime: Advances and Limitations | 271 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 10.3 | A Pluralist Approach to International Climate Change Law as an Alternative Model | 272 |
| 10.3.1 | The Virtues of a Pluralist Approach. | 273 |
| 10.3.2 | The Baby and the Bathwater | 276 |
| 10.4 | Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law | 278 |
| 10.5 | Conclusions | 281 |
| | References. | 282 |
| 11 | Commissions of Inquiry: Flexible Temporariness or Permanent Predictability? | 287 |
| | Christian Henderson | |
| 11.1 | Introduction | 288 |
| 11.2 | Commissions of Inquiry as Temporary Adjudicative Bodies of International Law. | 289 |
| 11.3 | The Impact of Temporary Commissions of Inquiry Upon International Legal Adjudication | 295 |
| 11.3.1 | The Formality of International Legal Adjudication. | 295 |
| 11.3.2 | The Principle of Non-intervention. | 300 |
| 11.3.3 | Procedural Fairness | 303 |
| 11.4 | Concluding Remarks: A Permanent Commission of Inquiry?. . . . | 307 |
| | References. | 310 |
| 12 | Special Temporary Measures and the Norm of Equality | 311 |
| | Adeno Addis | |
| 12.1 | Introduction | 312 |
| 12.2 | The Nature of Special Temporary Measures | 317 |
| 12.2.1 | Special Rights and Special Measures | 317 |
| 12.2.2 | The Nature of Special Measures | 318 |
| 12.3 | Equality and Special Measures | 321 |
| 12.3.1 | Equality as Non-discrimination (Equality of Treatment) | 321 |
| 12.3.2 | Equality as Equality of Opportunity | 322 |
| 12.4 | Temporariness and Predictability: The Issue of Durational Limit . . . | 325 |
| 12.5 | Temporariness and Predictability: The Virtue of Candor. | 327 |
| 12.6 | Conclusion | 329 |
| | References. | 330 |
| 13 | Paradise Postponed? For a Judge-Led Generic Model of International Criminal Procedure and an End to ‘Draft-as-You-Go’ | 331 |
| | Michael Bohlander | |
| 13.1 | Introduction | 332 |
| 13.2 | A Case in Point: The STL | 337 |
| 13.3 | The Conceptual Framework: Purpose, Fairness and Efficiency . . . | 341 |
| 13.3.1 | Characteristics of Domestic Procedures | 341 |

| | | |
|--------|--|-----|
| 13.3.2 | Problems of International Procedure: Geo-Politics, Mass Atrocities and Creation of a Historical Record . . . | 342 |
| 13.3.3 | Sources of International Criminal Procedure: The Limited Role of Human Rights Law | 343 |
| 13.3.4 | International Criminal Procedure and General Sources of International Law | 344 |
| 13.3.5 | Efficiency in Fairness: The Path Forward | 345 |
| 13.4 | Preferring the Judge-Led Model: Reasons and Parameters | 346 |
| 13.4.1 | Romantic Views of the Role of the Judge in the Adversarial Trial | 346 |
| 13.4.2 | Absence of the Dichotomy Between Spheres of Professional and Lay Adjudication | 347 |
| 13.4.3 | Efficiency Aspects: Adversarial Versus Judge-Led Model | 348 |
| 13.5 | Conclusion | 354 |
| | References | 355 |

Part II Dutch Practice in International Law

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 14 | Platforms, Protestors and Provisional Measures: The <i>Arctic Sunrise</i> Dispute and Environmental Activism at Sea | 359 |
| | Richard Caddell | |
| 14.1 | Introduction | 360 |
| 14.2 | The <i>Arctic Sunrise</i> Dispute | 362 |
| | 14.2.1 Jurisdiction of the Tribunal | 365 |
| | 14.2.2 Non-participation of the Respondent State | 368 |
| | 14.2.3 Prompt Release and Provisional Measures | 370 |
| 14.3 | Platforms and Protest Activism | 374 |
| | 14.3.1 Offshore Installations and the Law of the Sea | 374 |
| | 14.3.2 Freedom of Speech at Sea | 378 |
| 14.4 | Concluding Remarks | 382 |
| | References | 383 |
| | Table of Cases | 385 |
| | Index | 387 |