

HOUSTON LAW REVIEW



Volume 55

Spring 2018

Number 5

ARTICLES

One Oil and Gas Right to Rule Them All

By Monika U. Ehrman

THE JUDGE RUBY KLESS SONDOCK JURIST-IN-RESIDENCE LECTURESHIP

State High Courts and Individual Rights: The New York State Court of Appeals Recent Jurisprudence, from Skin-color Based Peremptory Challenges to the Right of Sepulcher

By Hon. Jenny Rivera

COMMENTS

See You Later . . . "Auer"-Gator: Time to End Judicial Deference to Agency Interpretations of Their Own Materials

By Christopher Atmar

Born in the Red: How Affirmative Action Could Cure the Race-Credit Divide

By Jordan Bartley Mack

Independent Contractor Injustice: The Case for Amending Discriminatory Discrimination Laws

By Orla O'Callaghan

ARTICLE

ONE OIL AND GAS RIGHT TO RULE THEM ALL

*Monika U. Ehrman**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------|
| I. INTRODUCTION | 1064 |
| II. THE NATURE OF THE EXECUTIVE RIGHT..... | 1068 |
| A. <i>Overview of the Executive Right and Its Major Issues</i> | 1068 |
| B. <i>Executive Right Issues Arising After Severance</i> | 1069 |
| 1. <i>The Natural Presumption Against Waste</i> | 1069 |
| 2. <i>Failure to Respect the Property Owner's Intentions</i> .. | 1071 |
| 3. <i>Economic Inefficiencies Resulting from the Severance of the Executive Right</i> | 1072 |
| III. THE CURRENT STANDARD OF CONDUCT APPROACH TO EXECUTIVE RIGHT PROBLEMS..... | 1074 |
| A. <i>The Standards of Conduct</i> | 1075 |
| B. <i>Review of Executive Right Jurisprudence Prior to Lesley v. Veterans' Land Board</i> | 1076 |
| C. <i>Lesley v. Veterans Land Board and Its Effect on Executive Right Jurisprudence</i> | 1081 |

* Associate Professor of Law, The University of Oklahoma College of Law; B.Sc. (Petroleum Eng.), University of Alberta; J.D., SMU Dedman School of Law; LL.M., Yale Law School. I thank Professor Robert Ellickson, Yale Law School, for comments given on an earlier version. This Article also benefited from feedback given during the 2015 Oklahoma Junior Scholars Conference and the 2016 Faculty Speaker Series at Texas A&M University School of Law, with particular thanks to Vanessa Casado-Peréz, Gabriel Eckstein, Glynn Lunney, and Franklin Snyder. I also thank my colleagues, Sarah Burstein, Kit Johnson, and Roger Michalski for their feedback. The University of Oklahoma Donald E. Pray Law Library provided extremely helpful research and editorial support. Finally, I thank the editors of the Houston Law Review for their careful reading and insightful comments and edits.

| | |
|--|------|
| 1. <i>The Conveyancing Issue</i> | 1084 |
| 2. <i>The Nature of the Duty that the Executive Owes to the Nonexecutive</i> | 1086 |
| 3. <i>Other Considerations by the Court</i> | 1088 |
| D. <i>Executive Right Jurisprudence Following Lesley v. Veterans Land Board</i> | 1089 |
| IV. POTENTIAL RESOLUTIONS FOR THE EXECUTIVE RIGHT | |
| PROBLEM..... | 1092 |
| A. <i>Non-Retroactive Prohibition of Executive Right Severance</i> | 1092 |
| B. <i>Adverse Possession of the Executive Right</i> | 1092 |
| C. <i>Employment of a Variable Standard of Conduct</i> | 1094 |
| 1. <i>Overview of the Various Duties Applicable in Executive Rights Cases</i> | 1094 |
| 2. <i>Determining When the Various Duties Apply</i> | 1095 |
| 3. <i>Criticism and Support for the Variable Duty Approach</i> | 1099 |
| D. <i>Enactment of Legislation Similar to Dormant Mineral Acts</i> | 1100 |
| E. <i>Finding an Implied Covenant to Develop the Mineral Estate in the Severing Instrument</i> | 1103 |
| V. PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS..... | |
| A. <i>Prior to a Severance</i> | 1104 |
| B. <i>After a Severance</i> | 1105 |
| VI. CONCLUSION..... | |
| | 1105 |

I. INTRODUCTION

The proverbial “bundle of sticks” is an analogy familiar to real property scholars.¹ The analogy compares property ownership to a bundle of sticks—that is, ownership composed of separate and individual property rights—where each “stick” represents a right or stream of benefits available to the property owner. Under the centuries-old common law *ad coelum* doctrine, real property contained all lands from the core of the earth to the sky. Although

1. See *United States v. Craft*, 535 U.S. 274, 278 (2002) (citations omitted) (stating that a “common idiom describes property as a ‘bundle of sticks’—a collection of individual rights which, in certain combinations, constitutes property. State law determines only which sticks are in a person’s bundle.”).