

# NEW YORK UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

Democratic Policing

*Barry Friedman & Maria Ponomarenko*

The Lost History of the Political Question Doctrine

*Tara Leigh Grove*

Make Me Democratic, But Not Yet:

Sunrise Lawmaking and Democratic Constitutionalism

*Daniel E. Herz-Roiphe & David Singh Grewal*

---

Good for the Gander, Good for the Goose:  
Extending the Affordable Care Act Under  
Equal Protection Law to Cover Male Sterilization

*Gabriel Ascher*

Reconciling Rational-Basis Review: When Does Rational Basis Bite?

*Raphael Holoszyc-Pimentel*

Resegregation and Nonparty Preclusion

*Steven D. Marcus*

An Adverse Reaction: FDA Regulation of Generic Drug Labeling

*Mitchell Russell Stern*

Volume 90



Number 6

December 2015

# NEW YORK UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

---

VOLUME 90

DECEMBER 2015

NUMBER 6

---

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

#### DEMOCRATIC POLICING

*Barry Friedman & Maria Ponomarenko* 1827

#### THE LOST HISTORY OF THE POLITICAL QUESTION DOCTRINE

*Tara Leigh Grove* 1908

#### MAKE ME DEMOCRATIC, BUT NOT YET: SUNRISE LAWMAKING AND DEMOCRATIC CONSTITUTIONALISM

*Daniel E. Herz-Roiphe & David Singh Grewal* 1975

### NOTES

#### GOOD FOR THE GANDER, GOOD FOR THE GOOSE: EXTENDING THE AFFORDABLE CARE ACT UNDER EQUAL PROTECTION LAW TO COVER MALE STERILIZATION

*Gabriel Ascher* 2029

#### RECONCILING RATIONAL-BASIS REVIEW: WHEN DOES RATIONAL BASIS BITE?

*Raphael Holoszyc-Pimentel* 2070

#### RESEGREGATION AND NONPARTY PRECLUSION

*Steven D. Marcus* 2118

#### AN ADVERSE REACTION: FDA REGULATION OF GENERIC DRUG LABELING

*Mitchell Russell Stern* 2154

INTRODUCTION .....	1829
I. POLICE EXCEPTIONALISM .....	1837
A. <i>The Requisites of American Law</i> .....	1837
B. <i>Policing Exceptionalism</i> .....	1843
1. <i>Legislative and Administrative Lacunae</i> .....	1843
2. <i>A Lack of Transparency</i> .....	1848
3. <i>Unevaluated Policy</i> .....	1850
4. <i>Policy Change</i> .....	1852
II. WHY POLICING IS DIFFERENT (AND WHY IT SHOULD NOT MATTER) .....	1855
A. <i>Doctrine: Policing and "Legislative" Rules</i> .....	1855
B. <i>History: Autonomy and Discretion</i> .....	1858
1. <i>The Rise of "Professionalism" and "Autonomy"</i> .....	1858
2. <i>The Rulemaking Movement</i> .....	1861
C. <i>Public Choice: Why Legislatures Won't Regulate Police</i> .....	1862
III. WHY JUDICIAL REVIEW DOES NOT ADDRESS POLICE EXCEPTIONALISM .....	1865
A. <i>Judicial Remedies Fail</i> .....	1865
1. <i>The Exclusionary Rule Is Ineffective</i> .....	1866
2. <i>Damages Actions Are Ineffective</i> .....	1867
B. <i>Judicial Review Is Ill-Equipped to Deal with the New Policing</i> .....	1871
C. <i>Judicial Review Cannot Substitute for Democratic Accountability</i> .....	1875
IV. SPECIAL PROBLEMS IN REGULATING POLICING .....	1877
A. <i>Are Rules Governing Policing Possible?</i> .....	1877
B. <i>Is Public Rulemaking Likely to Improve Policing?</i> ..	1879
C. <i>When Are Public Rules Required?</i> .....	1882
D. <i>When Is Secrecy Permissible?</i> .....	1884
E. <i>How Can the Rulemaking Process Be Scaled?</i> .....	1886
V. FROM HERE TO THERE .....	1889
A. <i>The Role Courts Can Play</i> .....	1889
1. <i>The Difficulty with Judicial Review</i> .....	1889
2. <i>A New Role for Courts</i> .....	1891
B. <i>Constitutional Fulcrums</i> .....	1892
1. <i>Requiring Authorization</i> .....	1893
2. <i>Statutory Remand Tools</i> .....	1894
3. <i>Safe Harbors</i> .....	1898
4. <i>Substantive Law</i> .....	1899
5. <i>Orchestrating Deliberation</i> .....	1901
C. <i>The Problem of Remedies</i> .....	1903
CONCLUSION .....	1907

# INDEX TO VOLUME 90

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### MADISON LECTURE

JUDICIAL GOVERNANCE AND JUDICIAL INDEPENDENCE: <i>The Honorable Anthony J. Scirica</i> .....	779
--	-----

### BRENNAN LECTURE

ACCESS TO JUSTICE: NEW APPROACHES TO ENSURE MEANINGFUL PARTICIPATION: <i>The Honorable Chase T. Rogers</i> .....	1447
--	------

### SYMPOSIUM: TESTING THE CONSTITUTION

FOREWORD: TESTING THE CONSTITUTION: <i>Lee Epstein, Barry Friedman &amp; Geoffrey R. Stone</i> .....	1001
TESTING <i>SHAW V. RENO</i> : DO MAJORITY-MINORITY DISTRICTS CAUSE EXPRESSIVE HARMS?: <i>Stephen Ansolabehere &amp; Nathaniel Persily</i> .....	1041
RHETORIC AND REALITY: TESTING THE HARM OF CAMPAIGN SPENDING: <i>Rebecca L. Brown &amp; Andrew D. Martin</i> .....	1066
MEASURING THE CHILLING EFFECT: <i>Brandice Canes-Wrone &amp; Michael C. Dorf</i> ..	1095
THE DECISION TO DEPART (OR NOT) FROM CONSTITUTIONAL PRECEDENT: AN EMPIRICAL STUDY OF THE ROBERTS COURT: <i>Lee Epstein, William M. Landes &amp; Adam Liptak</i> .....	1115
TESTING THE MARKETPLACE OF IDEAS: <i>Daniel E. Ho &amp; Frederick Schauer</i> .....	1160
LITIGATING STATE INTERESTS: ATTORNEYS GENERAL AS AMICI: <i>Margaret H. Lemos &amp; Kevin M. Quinn</i> .....	1229

### ARTICLES (BY AUTHOR)

BARKOW, RACHEL E.: <i>Clemency and Presidential Administration of Criminal Law</i> .....	802
BARNETT, KENT: <i>Codifying Chevmore</i> .....	1
BURCH, ELIZABETH CHAMBLEE: <i>Judging Multidistrict Litigation</i> .....	71
COLLINS, ERIN R.: <i>The Evidentiary Rules of Engagement in the War Against Domestic Violence</i> .....	397
DAS, ALINA: <i>Unshackling Habeas Review: Chevron Deference and Statutory Interpretation in Immigration Detention Cases</i> .....	143
FRIEDMAN, BARRY & MARIA PONOMARENKO: <i>Democratic Policing</i> .....	1827
GROVE, TARA LEIGH: <i>The Lost History of the Political Question Doctrine</i> .....	1908
HARMON, RACHEL A.: <i>Federal Programs and the Real Costs of Policing</i> .....	870
HERZ-ROIPHE, DANIEL E. & DAVID SINGH GREWAL: <i>Make Me Democratic, But Not Yet: Sunrise Lawmaking and Democratic Constitutionalism</i> .....	1975
LEMLEY, MARK A.: <i>IP in a World Without Scarcity</i> .....	460
RAO, NEOMI: <i>Administrative Collusion: How Delegation Diminishes the Collective Congress</i> .....	1463
SITARAMAN, GANESH & DAVID ZIONTS: <i>Behavioral War Powers</i> .....	516
STEPHANOPOULOS, NICHOLAS O.: <i>Political Powerlessness</i> .....	1527

## ARTICLES (BY TITLE)

ADMINISTRATIVE COLLUSION: HOW DELEGATION DIMINISHES THE COLLECTIVE CONGRESS: <i>Neomi Rao</i> .....	1463
BEHAVIORAL WAR POWERS: <i>Ganesh Sitaraman &amp; David Zions</i> .....	516
CLEMENCY AND PRESIDENTIAL ADMINISTRATION OF CRIMINAL LAW: <i>Rachel E. Barkow</i> .....	802
CODIFYING CHEVROE: <i>Kent Barnett</i> .....	1
DEMOCRATIC POLICING: <i>Barry Friedman &amp; Maria Ponomarenko</i> .....	1827
FEDERAL PROGRAMS AND THE REAL COSTS OF POLICING: <i>Rachel A. Harmon</i> ...	870
IP IN A WORLD WITHOUT SCARCITY: <i>Mark A. Lemley</i> .....	460
JUDGING MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION: <i>Elizabeth Chamblee Burch</i> .....	71
MAKE ME DEMOCRATIC, BUT NOT YET: SUNRISE LAWMAKING AND DEMOCRATIC CONSTITUTIONALISM: <i>Daniel E. Herz-Roiphe &amp; David Singh Grewal</i> .....	1975
POLITICAL POWERLESSNESS: <i>Nicholas O. Stephanopoulos</i> .....	1527
THE EVIDENTIARY RULES OF ENGAGEMENT IN THE WAR AGAINST DOMESTIC VIOLENCE: <i>Erin R. Collins</i> .....	397
THE LOST HISTORY OF THE POLITICAL QUESTION DOCTRINE: <i>Tara Leigh Grove</i> .	1908
UNSHACKLING HABEAS REVIEW: CHEVRON DEFERENCE AND STATUTORY INTERPRETATION IN IMMIGRATION DETENTION CASES: <i>Alina Das</i> .....	143

## NOTES

ALIGNING “EDUCATIONAL NECESSITY” WITH TITLE VI: AN ENHANCED REGULATORY ROLE FOR EXECUTIVE AGENCIES IN TITLE VI DISPARATE IMPACT ENFORCEMENT: <i>Brence D. Pernell</i> .....	1369
AN ADVERSE REACTION: FDA REGULATION OF GENERIC DRUG LABELING: <i>Mitchell Russell Stern</i> .....	2154
ARE WE MARRIED? STATE TAX FILING PROBLEMS AFTER <i>WINDSOR</i> : <i>Aaron M. Bernstein</i> .....	207
BOTNET TAKEDOWNS AND THE FOURTH AMENDMENT: <i>Sam Zeilin</i> .....	746
COST CONSIDERATION AND THE ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT: <i>Sheila Baynes</i> .....	961
CRUEL, UNUSUAL, AND COMPLETELY BACKWARDS: AN ARGUMENT FOR RETROACTIVE APPLICATION OF THE EIGHTH AMENDMENT: <i>Nishi Kumar</i> .....	1331
ENABLING STATE DEREGULATION OF MARIJUANA THROUGH EXECUTIVE BRANCH NONENFORCEMENT: <i>Bradley E. Markano</i> .....	289
FAILED SNITCHES AND SENTENCING STITCHES: SUBSTANTIAL ASSISTANCE AND THE COOPERATOR’S DILEMMA: <i>Shana Knizhnik</i> .....	1722
FIRST AMENDMENT LIMITATIONS ON POLICE SURVEILLANCE: THE CASE OF THE MUSLIM SURVEILLANCE PROGRAM: <i>Matthew A. Wasserman</i> .....	1786
FREE EXERCISE, INC.: A NEW FRAMEWORK FOR ADJUDICATING CORPORATE RELIGIOUS LIBERTY CLAIMS: <i>Thad Eagles</i> .....	589
FULL OF SOUND AND FURY: CURBING THE COST OF PARTISAN OPPORTUNISM IN CONGRESSIONAL OVERSIGHT HEARINGS: <i>Cristian R.C. Kelly</i> .....	253
GOOD FOR THE GANDER, GOOD FOR THE GOOSE: EXTENDING THE AFFORDABLE CARE ACT UNDER EQUAL PROTECTION LAW TO COVER MALE STERILIZATION: <i>Gabriel Ascher</i> .....	2029
IMMIGRATION RELIANCE ON GANG DATABASES: UNCHECKED DISCRETION AND UNDESIRABLE CONSEQUENCES: <i>Rebecca A. Hufstader</i> .....	671
“INQUIRIES THAT WE ARE ILL-EQUIPPED TO JUDGE”: FACTFINDING IN * * * * * COURT REVIEW OF AGENCY RULEMAKING: <i>Debmallo Shayan</i>	

MORE THAN “JOHNS,” LESS THAN TRAFFICKERS: IN SEARCH OF JUST AND PROPORTIONAL SANCTIONS FOR BUYERS OF SEX WITH TRAFFICKING VICTIMS: <i>Heather C. Gregorio</i> .....	626
NONJUDICIAL FANGS: DEFENDING THE PRIVACY ACT’S COMPLETE CIVIL REMEDIES EXEMPTION: <i>Joshua A. Rubin</i> .....	1409
PENNOYER’S GHOST: CONSENT, REGISTRATION STATUTES, AND GENERAL JURISDICTION AFTER <i>DAIMLER AG v. BAUMAN</i> : <i>Kevin D. Benish</i> .....	1609
RECONCILING RATIONAL-BASIS REVIEW: WHEN DOES RATIONAL BASIS BITE?: <i>Raphael Holoszyc-Pimentel</i> .....	2070
RESEGREGATION AND NONPARTY PRECLUSION: <i>Steven D. Marcus</i> .....	2118
ROUTINE EMERGENCIES: JUDICIAL REVIEW, LIABILITY RULES, AND THE HABEAS CORPUS ACT OF 1863: <i>Adrienne Lee Benson</i> .....	1662
RULE OF REASON WITHOUT A RHYME: USING “BIG DATA” TO BETTER ANALYZE ACCOUNTABLE CARE ORGANIZATIONS UNDER THE MEDICARE SHARED SAVINGS PROGRAM: <i>Shaun E. Werbelow</i> .....	361
SUPPORT WITH A CATCH: NEW YORK’S PERSONS IN NEED OF SUPERVISION AND PARENTAL RIGHTS: <i>Mikayla K. Consalvo</i> .....	1688
WHY SHOULDN’T WE PROTECT INTERNAL WHISTLEBLOWERS? EXPLORING JUSTIFICATIONS FOR THE <i>ASADI</i> DECISION: <i>Andrew Walker</i> .....	1761
YES, IT’S ILLEGAL TO CHEAT A PAYWALL: ACCESS RIGHTS AND THE DMCA’S ANTICIRCUMVENTION PROVISION: <i>Theresa M. Troupson</i> .....	325

### ONLINE FEATURES (BY PUBLICATION)

STRIVING FOR HERD IMMUNITY: <i>Andrew Janet</i> .....	1
MARRIAGE EQUALITY AND THE THIRD NAIL IN THE “PROCEED WITH CAUTION” COFFIN: <i>Ryan H. Nelson</i> .....	17
NOERR-PENNINGTON IMMUNITY AND THE ALIEN TORT STATUTE: <i>Aaron P. Brecher</i> .....	25
RETURN OF THE JRAD: <i>Jason A. Cade</i> .....	50