



ASSER PRESS

# Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2014

Between Pragmatism and Predictability:  
Temporariness in International Law

# Contents

## Part I Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law

<b>1</b>	<b>Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law</b> . . . . .	<b>3</b>
	Mónika Ambrus and Ramses A. Wessel	
1.1	Introduction . . . . .	4
1.2	Forms of Temporariness . . . . .	5
1.2.1	Temporary Objects . . . . .	6
1.2.2	Temporary Subjects . . . . .	8
1.3	International Law and Change . . . . .	9
1.3.1	Temporary Objects and International Law . . . . .	9
1.3.2	Temporary Subjects and International Law . . . . .	13
1.4	Conclusion: All Relative? . . . . .	15
	References . . . . .	16
<b>2</b>	<b>Temporariness and Change in Global Governance</b> . . . . .	<b>19</b>
	Rene Uruena	
2.1	Introduction . . . . .	20
2.2	International Law in a Constant Present . . . . .	21
2.3	Change and Temporariness . . . . .	26
2.3.1	Change and Temporariness in a Global Regulatory Space . . . . .	28
2.3.2	Thinking About Change in the Constant Present . . . . .	32
2.4	Normative Challenges . . . . .	33
2.5	Conclusion . . . . .	37
	References . . . . .	38

<b>Temporary International Legal Regimes as Frames for Permanent Ones</b> .....	41
Jean Galbraith	
3.1 Introduction .....	42
3.2 Why Use Temporary International Legal Regimes? .....	44
3.2.1 Factors Favouring the Use of Temporary Regimes .....	44
3.2.2 Sources of Strength for Temporary Regimes .....	47
3.3 Temporary Regimes as Foundations for Permanent Regimes .....	48
3.3.1 Causes .....	49
3.3.2 Implications .....	51
3.4 Case Studies .....	54
3.4.1 Refugee Law .....	54
3.4.2 International Criminal Law .....	58
3.4.3 Climate Change .....	61
3.5 Conclusion .....	63
References .....	63
<b>The International Rule of Law Time After Time: Temporary Institutions Between Change and Continuity</b> .....	67
Sofia Ranchordás	
4.1 Introduction .....	68
4.2 The (International) Rule of Law as a Source of Legal Certainty ..	71
4.2.1 The Rule of Law: Here, There and Everywhere? .....	71
4.2.2 The International Rule of Law and Time .....	76
4.2.3 The International Rule of Law as a Law of Lasting Rules? ..	78
4.3 Temporary Rules, Institutions and Measures .....	82
4.3.1 Temporary Legislation and the Rule of Law at Home .....	82
4.3.2 International Temporary Institutions, Rules and Measures .....	85
4.4 Conclusion .....	87
References .....	89
<b>International Law and Time: A Reflection of the Temporal Attitudes of International Lawyers Through Three Paradigms</b> .....	93
Christian Djeffal	
1 International Law in Time: The Familiar Stranger .....	94
2 Paradigm Shifts .....	96
5.2.1 The Temporalisation of International Law .....	97
5.2.2 The Flexibilisation of International Legal Time? .....	104
3 General Conclusions .....	115
References .....	117

<b>6</b>	<b>(Inter)Temporal Considerations in the Interpretative Process of the VCLT: Do Treaties Endure, Perdure or Exdure?</b> . . . . .	121
	Panos Merkouris	
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	122
6.2	Definitional Issues . . . . .	125
6.2.1	Endurantism, Perdurantism, and Exdurantism . . . . .	125
6.2.2	Intertemporal Law . . . . .	128
6.2.3	Principle of Contemporaneity and Evolutive/Dynamic Interpretation . . . . .	129
6.3	Silence Can Speak Volumes: The Lack of Explicit References to Intertemporal Considerations in the VCLT . . . . .	134
6.3.1	Pre-VCLT Considerations on the Topic . . . . .	134
6.3.2	Rejection of Explicit Incorporation of the Doctrine of Intertemporal Law in the VCLT: Draft Article 56 . . . . .	135
6.3.3	Rejection of Explicit Solutions to Intertemporal Considerations Through the Backdoor of Article 31 . . . . .	137
6.4	Points of Entry of Intertemporal Considerations in Article 31 VCLT . . . . .	139
6.4.1	Direct Point of Entry . . . . .	139
6.4.2	Indirect Point of Entry . . . . .	144
6.5	Limits . . . . .	150
6.6	Conclusion . . . . .	151
	References . . . . .	152
<b>7</b>	<b>Shifting Demands in International Institutional Law: Securing the United Nations' Accountability for the Haitian Cholera Outbreak.</b> . . . . .	157
	Kate Nancy Taylor	
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	158
7.2	The Responsibility of the UN for the Cholera Outbreak . . . . .	159
7.3	The UN's Jurisdictional Immunity . . . . .	161
7.4	Alternative Modes of Dispute Settlement . . . . .	164
7.4.1	The UN's Obligation to Settle Private Law Disputes . . . . .	164
7.4.2	Would the Cholera Claims Fall Within the Scope of the UN's Liability? . . . . .	165
7.4.3	Dispute Settlement Mechanisms in UN Peacekeeping Operations . . . . .	169
7.5	Shifting Demands in the Law of International Organisations . . . . .	172
7.5.1	Would a Domestic Court Be Willing to Adjudicate the Cholera Claims? . . . . .	172
7.5.2	Elevating the Cholera Claims to an International Level . . . . .	176
7.5.3	The Rule of Law in the UN and the Handling of the Cholera Claims . . . . .	178
7.5.4	The Human Rights Imperative . . . . .	180
7.5.5	Demands for the Enhanced Accountability of the UN . . . . .	183

7.6	Permanent Versus <i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions . . . . .	187
7.6.1	Theorising Permanent Solutions . . . . .	187
7.6.2	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions: A Revised Role for Domestic Courts? . . . . .	189
7.7	Conclusion . . . . .	191
	References . . . . .	192

## **Protecting Human Rights During Emergencies: Delegation, Derogation, and Deference . . . . .**

	Evan J. Criddle	
8.1	Introduction . . . . .	198
8.2	The Resilience of Derogation Standards . . . . .	201
8.3	Derogation Standards as Delegations . . . . .	206
8.4	Deference for an Altruistic Regime . . . . .	212
8.5	Conclusion . . . . .	218
	References . . . . .	219

## **Temporary Protection: Hovering at the Edges of Refugee Law . . . . .**

	Jean-François Durieux	
9.1	Introduction . . . . .	222
9.2	Time in the International Legal Regime . . . . .	226
9.2.1	Time as 'Attachment' . . . . .	226
9.2.2	Time as Deadline . . . . .	227
9.2.3	A Clash of Times . . . . .	230
9.3	Temporary Protection in Europe, 1992–2001 . . . . .	232
9.3.1	A Time of Crisis . . . . .	233
9.3.2	After the Crisis . . . . .	240
9.4	Hovering on . . . . .	244
9.5	Conclusion: Time for a Showdown . . . . .	249
	References . . . . .	252

## **Between the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea: Enhancing Flexibility**

	10 International Climate Change Law . . . . .	255
	Barro van Asselt	
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	256
10.2	Flexibility in the United Nations Climate Change Regime . . . . .	258
10.2.1	Delegated Law-Making . . . . .	259
10.2.2	Scientific Input . . . . .	260
10.2.3	Review and Amendment . . . . .	262
10.2.4	Entry into Force, Reservations and Withdrawal . . . . .	265
10.2.5	Differentiation . . . . .	266
10.2.6	Implementation . . . . .	268
10.2.7	Compliance . . . . .	269
10.2.8	Flexibility in the Climate Change Regime: Advances and Limitations . . . . .	271

10.3	A Pluralist Approach to International Climate Change Law as an Alternative Model . . . . .	272
10.3.1	The Virtues of a Pluralist Approach . . . . .	273
10.3.2	The Baby and the Bathwater . . . . .	276
10.4	Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law . . . . .	278
10.5	Conclusions . . . . .	281
	References . . . . .	282
<b>11</b>	<b>Commissions of Inquiry: Flexible Temporariness or Permanent Predictability?</b> . . . . .	<b>287</b>
	Christian Henderson	
11.1	Introduction . . . . .	288
11.2	Commissions of Inquiry as Temporary Adjudicative Bodies of International Law . . . . .	289
11.3	The Impact of Temporary Commissions of Inquiry Upon International Legal Adjudication . . . . .	295
11.3.1	The Formality of International Legal Adjudication . . . . .	295
11.3.2	The Principle of Non-intervention . . . . .	300
11.3.3	Procedural Fairness . . . . .	303
11.4	Concluding Remarks: A Permanent Commission of Inquiry? . . . . .	307
	References . . . . .	310
<b>12</b>	<b>Special Temporary Measures and the Norm of Equality</b> . . . . .	<b>311</b>
	Adeno Addis	
12.1	Introduction . . . . .	312
12.2	The Nature of Special Temporary Measures . . . . .	317
12.2.1	Special Rights and Special Measures . . . . .	317
12.2.2	The Nature of Special Measures . . . . .	318
12.3	Equality and Special Measures . . . . .	321
12.3.1	Equality as Non-discrimination (Equality of Treatment) . . . . .	321
12.3.2	Equality as Equality of Opportunity . . . . .	322
12.4	Temporariness and Predictability: The Issue of Durational Limit . . . . .	325
12.5	Temporariness and Predictability: The Virtue of Candor . . . . .	327
12.6	Conclusion . . . . .	329
	References . . . . .	330
<b>13</b>	<b>Paradise Postponed? For a Judge-Led Generic Model of International Criminal Procedure and an End to 'Draft-as-You-Go'</b> . . . . .	<b>331</b>
	Michael Bohlander	
13.1	Introduction . . . . .	332
13.2	A Case in Point: The STL . . . . .	337
13.3	The Conceptual Framework: Purpose, Fairness and Efficiency . . . . .	341
13.3.1	Characteristics of Domestic Procedures . . . . .	341

13.3.2	Problems of International Procedure: Geo-Politics, Mass Atrocities and Creation of a Historical Record . . .	342
13.3.3	Sources of International Criminal Procedure: The Limited Role of Human Rights Law . . . . .	343
13.3.4	International Criminal Procedure and General Sources of International Law . . . . .	344
13.3.5	Efficiency in Fairness: The Path Forward . . . . .	345
13.4	Preferring the Judge-Led Model: Reasons and Parameters . . . .	346
13.4.1	Romantic Views of the Role of the Judge in the Adversarial Trial . . . . .	346
13.4.2	Absence of the Dichotomy Between Spheres of Professional and Lay Adjudication . . . . .	347
13.4.3	Efficiency Aspects: Adversarial Versus Judge-Led Model . . . . .	348
13.5	Conclusion . . . . .	354
	References . . . . .	355

## Part II Dutch Practice in International Law

<b>14</b>	<b>Platforms, Protestors and Provisional Measures: The <i>Arctic Sunrise</i> Dispute and Environmental Activism at Sea . . . . .</b>	<b>359</b>
	Richard Caddell	
14.1	Introduction . . . . .	360
14.2	The <i>Arctic Sunrise</i> Dispute . . . . .	362
14.2.1	Jurisdiction of the Tribunal . . . . .	365
14.2.2	Non-participation of the Respondent State . . . . .	368
14.2.3	Prompt Release and Provisional Measures . . . . .	370
14.3	Platforms and Protest Activism . . . . .	374
14.3.1	Offshore Installations and the Law of the Sea . . . . .	374
14.3.2	Freedom of Speech at Sea . . . . .	378
14.4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	382
	References . . . . .	383
	<b>Table of Cases . . . . .</b>	<b>385</b>
	<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>387</b>