

NATIONAL JOURNAL OF ♦♦ REVUE NATIONALE DE  
**CONSTITUTIONAL • • DROIT**  
**LAW • • CONSTITUTIONNEL**

**22.2**

---

Vol. 22 No. 2 August/août 2008 22 NJCL 119-266

---

**ARTICLES**

DR. SAMUEL J. CHALDOUR, Making Federalism Work for Climate Change:  
Canada's Division of Powers over Carbon Taxes/119-214

KAREN LEES, Proportionally Reconciling Floor-crossing with Conflicting *Charter*  
Rights: A Proposal for Regulating the Practice/215-243

DAVID M. TORRELL, Looking For Change: Economic Rights,  
The *Charter* and The Politics of Panhandling/245-266

**THOMSON**

  
**CARSWELL**

# **Making Federalism Work for Climate Change: Canada's Division of Powers over Carbon Taxes**

*Dr. Nathalie J. Chalifour*<sup>1,2</sup>

## **Table of Contents**

1.	INTRODUCTION .....	122
2.	BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT .....	124
	(a) Climate Change Policy .....	124
	(b) Carbon Taxes .....	130
	(i) <i>The Theoretical Basis for Carbon Taxes</i> .....	131
	(ii) <i>Instrument Choice</i> .....	133
	(iii) <i>Designing a Carbon Tax</i> .....	136
	(iv) <i>Use of Carbon Taxes Around the World</i> .....	139
	(c) Constitutional Analysis .....	142
	(i) <i>The Division of Legislative Powers Analysis</i> .....	142
	(ii) <i>Characterizing the "Pith and Substance"</i> .....	143
	(iii) <i>The 'Double Aspect' Doctrine</i> .....	144
	(iv) <i>The 'Necessarily Incidental' Test</i> .....	145
	(v) <i>Dealing with Conflict</i> .....	147
	(vi) <i>Interjurisdictional Co-operation</i> .....	148

---

1 J.S.D. (Stanford), J.S.M. (Stanford), LL.B. (Western). Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa.

2 The author is grateful for the excellent research assistance provided by Martin Kreuser, Catherine Archibald, Lia Magi & Jonathan Laski, LL.B. candidates at the University of Ottawa at the time of research and writing.

3.	THE "PITH AND SUBSTANCE" DETERMINATION OF A CARBON TAX .....	148
	(a) Possible Characterizations of a Carbon Tax .....	149
	(b) Factors that Could Influence Characterization.....	151
4.	RELEVANT HEADS OF POWER FOR CARBON TAXES.....	154
	(a) Relating to Revenue-raising.....	154
	(i) <i>The Federal Taxation Power (s. 91(3))</i> .....	154
	(ii) <i>The Provincial Direct Taxation Power (s. 92(2))</i> ...	156
	(iii) <i>Provincial Power to Tax Natural Resources (s. 92A(4))</i> .....	160
	(iv) <i>Provincial Power to Charge License Fees (s. 92(9))</i> .....	160
	(b) Relating to Energy Policy.....	165
	(i) <i>Power over Local Works and Undertakings (s. 92(10))</i> .....	165
	(ii) <i>Provincial Power over Property and Civil Rights (s. 92(13))</i> .....	167
	(iii) <i>Provincial Power over Natural Resources (s. 92A)</i> .....	168
	(iv) <i>Power over Public Lands (s. 92(5) and s. 91(1A))</i> .....	172
	(c) Relating to Environmental Purposes.....	173
	(i) <i>Federal Criminal Power (s. 91(27))</i> .....	175
	(ii) <i>Federal Trade and Commerce Power (s. 91(2))</i> ....	177
	(iii) <i>Peace, Order and Good Government</i> .....	179
	(iv) <i>Provincial Power over Property and Civil Rights (s. 92(13))</i> .....	182
5.	AUTHORITY OF THE FEDERAL AND PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS TO INSTITUTE A CARBON TAX.....	183
	(a) A Federal Carbon Tax.....	183
	(b) A Provincial Carbon Tax.....	197
6.	CASE STUDIES .....	200
	(a) Québec's Carbon Tax.....	200
	(b) British Columbia's Carbon Tax .....	206
7.	CONCLUSION .....	213