

COLUMBIA LAW REVIEW



SYMPOSIUM

SENTENCING: WHAT'S AT STAKE FOR THE STATES?

Rachel E. Barkow
Frank O. Bowman, III
R.A. Duff
Richard S. Frase
Kyron Huigens
Nancy J. King, David A. Soulé,
Sara Steen, & Robert R. Weidner
Gerard E. Lynch

Marc L. Miller
William H. Pryor Jr.
Kevin R. Reitz
Paul H. Robinson &
Barbara A. Spellman
Michael Tonry
Ronald F. Wright
Franklin E. Zimring

COLUMBIA LAW REVIEW

VOL. 105

MAY 2005

NO. 4

CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM

SENTENCING: WHAT'S AT STAKE FOR THE STATES?

INTRODUCTION

- SENTENCING: LEARNING FROM, AND
WORRYING ABOUT, THE STATES *Gerard E. Lynch* 933

KEYNOTE ADDRESS

- LESSONS OF A SENTENCING REFORMER
FROM THE DEEP SOUTH *William H. Pryor Jr.* 943

PANEL ONE: PROSECUTORIAL DISCRETION AND ITS CHALLENGES

- WHEN PROCESS AFFECTS PUNISHMENT:
DIFFERENCES IN SENTENCES AFTER GUILTY
PLEA, BENCH TRIAL, AND JURY TRIAL IN
FIVE GUIDELINES STATES *Nancy J. King* 959
David A. Soule
Sara Steen
Robert R. Weidner

- SENTENCING COMMISSIONS AS PROVOCATEURS
OF PROSECUTORIAL SELF-REGULATION *Ronald F. Wright* 1010

PANEL TWO: CONSIDERATIONS AT SENTENCING—WHAT FACTORS ARE RELEVANT AND WHO SHOULD DECIDE?

- SOLVING THE *WILLIAMS* PUZZLE *Kyron Huigens* 1048

- THE NEW SENTENCING CONUNDRUM:
POLICY AND CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
AT CROSS-PURPOSES *Kevin R. Reitz* 1082

- SENTENCING DECISIONS: MATCHING THE
DECISIONMAKER TO THE DECISION NATURE *Paul H. Robinson* 1124
Barbara A. Spellman

**PANEL THREE: THEORIES AND POLICIES UNDERLYING
GUIDELINES SYSTEMS**

- GUIDANCE AND GUIDELINES *R.A. Duff* 1162
- STATE SENTENCING GUIDELINES:
DIVERSITY, CONSENSUS, AND
UNRESOLVED POLICY ISSUES *Richard S. Frase* 1190
- OBSOLESCENCE AND IMMANENCE IN
PENAL THEORY AND POLICY *Michael Tonry* 1233

**PANEL FOUR: THE INSTITUTIONAL CONCERNS INHERENT
IN SENTENCING REGIMES**

- FEDERALISM AND THE POLITICS OF SENTENCING *Rachel E. Barkow* 1276
- THE FAILURE OF THE FEDERAL SENTENCING
GUIDELINES: A STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS *Frank O. Bowman, III* 1315
- A MAP OF SENTENCING AND A COMPASS FOR
JUDGES: SENTENCING INFORMATION
SYSTEMS, TRANSPARENCY, AND THE
NEXT GENERATION OF REFORM *Marc L. Miller* 1351
- THE UNEXAMINED DEATH PENALTY:
CAPITAL PUNISHMENT AND REFORM OF
THE MODEL PENAL CODE *Franklin E. Zimring* 1396