

# The Yale Law Journal

Volume 88, Number 7, June 1979

## Defenses, Presumptions, and Burden of Proof in the Criminal Law\*

John Calvin Jeffries, Jr.<sup>†</sup> and Paul B. Stephan III<sup>‡</sup>

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |      |
|--|------|
| Introduction   | 1325 |
| I. Burden of Proof as an Exclusively Procedural Concern                                  | 1328 |
| A. <i>The Constitutionalization of Burden of Proof and the Inadequacies of Formalism</i> | 1328 |
| B. <i>The Procedural Interpretation of In re Winship</i>                                 | 1333 |
| C. <i>The Rise and Fall of Mullaney v. Wilbur</i>  | 1338 |
| D. <i>Flaws in the Procedural Approach</i>   | 1344 |
| 1. <i>A Theoretical Critique</i>   | 1344 |
| 2. <i>A Practical Evaluation</i>   | 1353 |
| II. Substantive Justice  | 1356 |
| A. <i>Substantive Justice and the Limits of Procedure</i>                                | 1357 |
| B. <i>Burden of Proof and Substantive Justice</i>  | 1359 |

\* This article is an elaboration of views first stated in Low & Jeffries, *DICTA: Constitutionalizing the Criminal Law?* Va. L. Weekly, Mar. 25, 1977, at 1. The authors would like to thank Thomas F. Bergin, Richard J. Bonnie, Ronald A. Cass, Thomas H. Jackson, Jerry L. Mashaw, Harvey S. Perlman, Stephen A. Saltzburg, and Peter Westen for their criticisms and comments. Thanks are also due to Jonathan Koch, Barbara Schilberg, and Douglas Sullivan for research assistance and to Andrew Brumby for preparation of the appendix. Most especially, the authors acknowledge their continuing intellectual indebtedness to Peter W. Low. Without his guidance and encouragement, this piece would not have been done.

<sup>†</sup> Assistant Professor of Law, the University of Virginia.

<sup>‡</sup> J.D. 1977, the University of Virginia School of Law.



CENTER FOR LINCOLN

# The Yale Law Journal

Volume 88  
Number 7  
June 1979

Defenses, Presumptions, and Burden of Proof in the  
Criminal Law

*John Calvin Jeffries, Jr. and Paul B. Stephan III*

Law and the Crystal Ball: Predicting Behavior with  
Statistical Inference and Individualized Judgment

*Barbara D. Underwood*

Credit Scoring and the ECOA: Applying the Effects  
Test

State Economic Substantive Due Process: A Proposed  
Approach

Efficiency and Competition in the Electric-Power  
Industry

Reviews: *Gary J. Miller, Richard B. Stewart*