



# **Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals**

**V O L U M E**

**The International  
Criminal Tribunal  
for Rwanda 2004**

**André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)**



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents . . . . .	5
Preface . . . . .	
Part XI Preliminary Matters	
1. Issues related to the indictment	
Decision on Prosecutor's Interlocutory Appeal Against Trial Chamber II Decision of 6 October 2003 Denying Leave to File Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-AR50, A. Ch., 12 February 2004 . . . . .	11
Individual Opinion of Judge Pocar . . . . .	18
Decision on Preliminary Defence Motion Regarding Defects in the Form of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Simba</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-76-I, T. Ch. 1, 6 May 2004 . . . . .	19
Decision on the Preliminary Motions by the Defence of Joseph Nzirorera, Edouard Karemera, Andre Rwamakuba and Mathieu Ngirumpatse Challenging Jurisdiction in Relation to Joint Criminal Enterprise (Article 6(1) of the Statute, Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T Ch. III, 11 May 2004 . . . . .	23
Separate Opinion of Judge Lattanzi on the "Decision on the Preliminary Motions by the Defence of Joseph Nzirorera, Edouard Karemera, Andre Rwamakuba and Mathieu Ngirumpatse Challenging Jurisdiction in Relation to Joint Criminal Enterprise". . . . .	33
Decision on the Defence's Preliminary Motion Challenging the Second Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Simba</i> , T. Ch. I, Case No. ICTR-01-76-I, 14 July 2004 . . . . .	37
Decision on the Defence Preliminary Motion Objecting to the Form of the Amended Indictment (Rule 72 (A) (ii) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-I, T. Ch. III, 15 July 2004 . . . . .	41
Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Regarding Application of Joint Criminal Enterprise to the Crime of Genocide, <i>Rwamakuba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-4-AR72.4, A. Ch., 22 October 2004 . . . . .	51
Commentary <i>Karel de Meester</i> . . . . .	62
Part 2/ Procedural Matters	
2. Fair trial/ joinder	
Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Application for a Hearing or Other Relief on his Motion for Dismissal for Violation of his Right to a Trial Without Undue Delay, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 3 November 2004. . . . .	71
Commentary <i>Thorn Dieben</i> . . . . .	78

**3. Evidentiary issues and witnesses**

Decision on Prosecutors Motion for the Admission of Written Witness Statements under Rule 92bis, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 9 March 2004. . . . . 87

Decision on Motion to Extend Delay to File a Response of Defendant Bicamumpaka to "Prosecutor's Very Urgent Motion to Vary his Initial List of Witnesses in Response to Status Conference Deliberations of 5 March 2004 and Varying/Modifying his Motion for Leave to Vary his Initial List of Witnesses Still Pending Before the Trial Chamber", *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. 11, 25 May 2004. . . . . 97

Decision on Request for Admission of Additional Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gerard Ntakirutimana*, Cases No. ICTR-96-10-A and ICTR-96-17-A, A. Ch., 5 July 2004\_99

Reasons for the Decision on Request for Admission of Additional Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gerard Ntakirutimana*, Cases No. ICTR-96-10-A and ICTR-96-17-A, A. Ch., 8 September 2004. . . . . 103

Separate Opinion of Judge Schomburg . . . . . 115

Decision on Mugiraneza Interlocutory Appeal Against Decision of the Trial Chamber on Exclusion of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-AR73.3andAR73.4, A.Ch., 15 July 2004. . . . . 117

Decision on Prosecutor's Motion to Allow Witness DBO to Give Testimony by Means of Deposition, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 25 August 2004. . . . . 125

Decision on Prosecutor's Motion for Site Visits in the Republic of Rwanda, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 29 September 2004\_\_\_\_\_ 129

Decision (Reconsideration of the Trial Chamber's Decision of 5 February 2004 Pursuant to the Appeals Chamber's Decision of 15 July 2004), *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 4 October 2004. . . . . 133

Decision on Prosecution Request for Testimony of Witness BT via Video-Link, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 8 October 2004. . . . . 143

Decision on the Defence Motion to Recall Witness KEL for Further Cross-Examination, *Prosecutor v. Simba*, Case No. ICTR-01-76-T, T. Ch. I., 28 October 2004. . . . . 149

Decision on the Defence Request for Necessary Resources for investigations, *Prosecutor v. Gatete*, Case No. ICTR-2000-61-I, T. Ch. I, 2 November 2004. . . . . 153

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion and Notice of Adjudicated Facts (Rule 94 (B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-T. T. Ch. II, 10 December 2004. . . . . 157

Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's First Motion for Judicial Notice Pursuant to Rule 94 (B), *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 10 December 2004. . . . . 165

Decision on Jérôme-Clément Bicamumpaka's Motion for Judicial Notice of a Rwandan Judgement of 8 December 2000 and in the Alternative for an Order to Disclose Exculpatory Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza*, Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 15 December 2004. . . . . 171

Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i> . . . . .	177
<b>4. Ad litem judges and changes in the composition of a chamber</b>	
Decision on Continuation of Trial (Article <i>Mquarter</i> of the Statute and Rule <a href="#">5bis</a> (D) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 24 May 2004. . . . .	185
Decision in the Matter of Proceedings under Rule <a href="#">5bis</a> (D), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-A15&W, A. Ch., 21 June 2004. . . . .	189
Decision on Continuation of Trial (Rule 1 <i>Sbis</i> (D) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. <b>ICTR-98-44-T, T.Ch. III, 16 July 2004</b> . . . . .	195
Reasons for Decision on Interlocutory Appeals Regarding the Continuation of Proceedings With a Substitute Judge and on Nzirorera's Motion for Leave to Consider New Material, <i>Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. <b>ICTR-98-44-AR15te.2</b> , A. Ch., 22 October 2004. . . . .	213
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen . . . . .	228
Declaration of Judge Schomburg in Relation to Reasons for Decision on Interlocutory Appeals Regarding the Continuation of Proceedings With a Substitute Judge and on Nzirorera's Motion for Leave to Consider New Material, 23 October 2004. . . . .	229
Decision on Severance of Andre Rwamakuba and Amendments of the Indictment (Article 20(4) of the Statute, Rule 82 (B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. <b>III</b> , 7 December 2004 . . . . .	231
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Short on Severance of Andre Rwamakuba and Amendments of the Indictment, 8 December 2004. . . . .	239
Commentary <i>Steve Becker</i> . . . . .	241
<b>5. Cooperation</b>	
Decision on Defence Motion to Obtain Cooperation From the Vatican Pursuant to Article 28, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze andNsengiyumva</i> , Case No. <b>ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 13 May 2004</b> . . . . .	251
Decision on Matters Related to Witness KDD's Judicial Dossier, <i>Prosecutor v. Simba</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-76-T, T. Ch. I, 1 November 2004. . . . .	253
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i> . . . . .	258
<b>Part 3/ Judgement and Sentencing</b>	
<b>6. Judgements</b>	
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambiki andImanishimwe</i> , Case No. <b>ICTR-99-46-T</b> , T. Ch. III, 25 February 2004. . . . .	267
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Williams. . . . .	425
Separate Opinion of Judge Ostrovsky. . . . .	431
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Dolenc. . . . .	437
Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Yannis Naziris</i> . . . . .	468

Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Gacumbitsi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-64-T, T. Ch. III, 17 June 2004. . . . .	481
Commentary <i>Steven Freeland</i> . . . . .	555
Judgement, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-A, A. Ch., 9 July 2004. . . . .	563
Commentary <i>Joachim Renzikowski</i> . . . . .	626
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndindabahizi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-71-1, T. Ch. I, 15 July 2004. . . . .	645
Commentary <i>Ignaz Stegmiller</i> . . . . .	748
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gerard Ntakirutimana</i> , Cases Nos. ICTR-96-10-A and ICTR-96-17-A, A. Ch., 13 December 2004. . . . .	755
Commentary <i>Olaoluwa Olusanya</i> . . . . .	883
Index . . . . .	893
Contributors and Editors. . . . .	897