



Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

V O L U M E 16

**Timor Leste
The Special Panels for
Serious Crimes 2003-2005**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table of Contents | 5 |
| Preface by the Editors | 11 |
| Preface by Nicholas Koumjian | 13 |
| | |
| Part 1/ Preliminary and procedural matters | |
| 1. Arrest warrant/indictment | |
| Decision on the Defense (Domingos Mendonca) Motion for the Court to Order the Public Prosecutor to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. João Sarmentó and Domingos Mendonca</i> , Case No. 18a/2001, SPSC, 24 July 2003. | 19 |
| Decision on Defendant's Second Challenge to the Indictment: Motion to Dismiss Indictment as Insufficient, <i>Prosecutor v. Abilio Mendes Correia</i> , Case No. 19/2001, SPSC, 2 March 2004. | 27 |
| Decision on the Defense Motion to Dismiss the Indictment Dated 23 January 2004, <i>Prosecutor v. Rudolfo Alves Correia</i> , Case No. 27/2003, SPSC, 2 March 2004. | 29 |
| Decision on the Defendants' Motion on Defects in the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Amati and Francisco Matos</i> , Case No. 12/2003, SPSC, 11 November 2004. | 33 |
| Commentary <i>Anne-Sophie Massa</i> | 37 |
| 2. Decisions related to the arrest warrant for General Wiranto | |
| Decision on the Motion of the Deputy General Prosecutor for a Hearing on the Application for an Arrest Warrant in the Case of Wiranto, <i>Deputy General Prosecutor v. Wiranto, Zacky Anwar Makarim, Kiki Syahnakri, Adam Rachmat Damiri, Suhartono Suratman, Mohammad Noer Muis, Yayat Sudrajat and Abilio Jose Osorio Soares</i> , Case No. 5/2003, SPSC, 18 February 2004. | 51 |
| Warrant of Arrest for Wiranto, <i>Deputy General Prosecutor v. Wiranto</i> Case No. 5/2003, SPSC, 10 May 2004. | 63 |
| Decision on the Motion of the Prosecutor General to Review and Amend the Indictment, <i>Deputy General Prosecutor v. Wiranto and others</i> , Case No. 5/2003, SPSC, 17 May 2004. | 75 |
| Legal Ruling Concerning the Applicability of <i>Ne Bis In Idem</i> at the Arrest Warrant Stage of the Proceedings, <i>Deputy General Prosecutor v. Wiranto et ai</i> , Case No. 5/2003, SPSC, 5 May 2005 .. | 79 |
| Commentary <i>André de Hoogh</i> | 85 |
| 3. Decisions related to the applicable criminal law | |
| Decision on the Defense Motion to Dismiss Count 1 of the Indictment for Failure to Establish a <i>Prima Facie</i> Case, <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Amati and Francisco Matos</i> , Case No. 12/2003, SPSC, 11 July 2003. | 97 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Armando dos Santos</i> , Case No. 16/2001, CoA, 15 July 2003 Dissenting opinion Judge Jacinta Correia da Costa | 103 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2002/3), <i>Prosecutor v. Augustino da Costa</i> , Case No. 7/2000, 18 July 2003 [Translation by the Editors] | .117 |
| Dissenting Opinion Judge Jacinta Correia da Costa | .125 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2003/10), <i>Prosecutor v. Joanico Gusmão</i> , CoA, 18 July 2003 [Translation by the Editors] | .129 |
| Dissenting Opinion Judge Jacinta Correia da Costa | .139 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/31), <i>Prosecutor v. Manuel Goncalves Leto Bere</i> , Case No. 10/2001, CoA. 16 October 2003 [Translation by the Editors] | .143 |
| Dissenting Opinion Judge Jacinta Correia da Costa | .151 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2003/50), <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Amati and Francisco Matos</i> , Case No. 12/2003, CoA, 9 December 2003 | .155 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2004/20), <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Goncalves</i> , Case No. 11/2001, CoA, 14 September 2004 [Translation by the Editors] | .165 |
| Commentary <i>Andre Klip</i> | .172 |
| 4. Provisional release/detention | |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2003/39), <i>Prosecutor v. Carlos Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, CoA, 24 September 2003 | .177 |
| Decision on Prosecutor's Request for Pretrial Detention, <i>Prosecutor v. Sisto Barros, Cesar Mendonca and Josep Nahak</i> , Case No. 1/2004, SPSC, 17 March 2004 | .183 |
| Decision on the Application for Initial Detention of the Accused <i>Aprecio Mali Dao</i> , <i>Prosecutor v. Aprecio Mali Dao</i> . Case No. 18/2003, SPSC, 29 April 2004 | .191 |
| Commentary (\-Iso <i>Eduardo Faria Coracini</i>) | .199 |
| 5. Evidentiary decisions | |
| Decision to the Motion of the Defense of Carlos Ena to Call the Co-Accused Umbertus Ena to Declare as a Witness, <i>Prosecutor v. Umbertus Ena and Carlos Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, SPSC, 4 December 2003 | .205 |
| Decision on the Defendant's Motion to Exclude Prosecutor's 27 January 2004 "Transfer of Material" From Court File. <i>Prosecutor v. Abilio Mendes Correia</i> , Case No. 19/2001, SPSC, 1 March 2004 | .209 |
| Decision on the Prosecutor's Request to Dismiss the Defendant's Notice of Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Vmbertos Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, SPSC, 17 June 2004 | .213 |
| Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Rudolfo Aives Carreta</i> , Case No. 27/2003, SPSC, 19 July 2004 | .217 |
| Dissenting Opinion on the Defendant's Oral Motion to Exclude Statement of the Accused, <i>Prosecutor v. Francisco Pereira</i> , Case No. 34/2003, SPSC, 17 September 2004 | .221 |
| Commentary <i>Gentian Zyberi</i> | .227 |
| 6. Fitness to stand trial | |
| Findings and Order on Defendant Nahak's Competence to Stand Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Josep Nahak</i> , Case No. 1a/2004, SPSC, 1 March 2005 | .233 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Commentary <i>Peter Bal</i> | 258 |
| Part 2/ Judgements | |
| 7. Judgements | |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Benjamin Sarmentó and Romeiro Tilman</i> , Case No. 18/2001, SPSC, 16 July 2003. | 269 |
| Disposition of the Decision Relating to the Conviction of the Accused Benjamin Sarmentó and Romeiro Tilman | 289 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Joao Sarmentó</i> , Case No. 18a/2001, SPSC, 12 August 2003. | 293 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Mendonca</i> , Case No. 18b/2001, SPSC, 13 October 2003. | 309 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Maria Natércia Gusmão Pereira | 329 |
| Commentary <i>Fabián O. Raimondo</i> | 330 |
| 8. Judgements | |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Anastacio Martins and Domingos Goncalves</i> , Case No. 11/2001, SPSC, 13 November 2003. | 339 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Carlos Soares</i> , Case No. 9/2002, SPSC, 8 December 2003. | 357 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Salvador Soares</i> , Case No. 7a/2002, SPSC, 9 December 2003. | 365 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Biunk. | 389 |
| Commentary <i>James Cockayne</i> | 390 |
| 9. Judgements | |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Damiao da Costa Nunes</i> , Case No. 1/2003, SPSC, 10 December 2003 | 403 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Blunk. | 414 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Marcelino Soares</i> , Case No. 11/2003, SPSC, 11 December 2003. | 415 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Inacio Olivera, Gilberto Fernandes and Jose da Costa</i> , Case No. 12/2002, 23 December 2003. | 425 |
| Final Decision. <i>Prosecutor v. Paulino de Jesus</i> , Case No. 6/2002, SPSC, 26 January 2004. | 439 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Héider Viana do Carmo, 19 January 2004. | 446 |
| Commentary <i>Leena Grover and Claus Krefi</i> | 447 |
| 10. Judgements | |
| Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Ahilio Mendes Correia</i> , Case No. 19/2001, SPSC, 9 March 2004. | 457 |
| Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Lino de Carvalho</i> , Case No. 10 /2001, SPSC, 18 March 2004. | 467 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Umbertus Ena and Carlos Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, SPSC, 23 March 2004 | 477 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Florindo Morreira</i> , Case No. 29/2003, SPSC, 19 May 2004. | 491 |
| Commentary <i>Robert Cryer</i> | 495 |

11. Judgements

| | |
|--|-----|
| Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Beny Ludji and José Gusmão</i> , Case No. 16/2003, SPSC, 19 May 2004 [Translation by the Editors] | 505 |
| Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro and Miguel Angelo Lemos</i> | 517 |
| Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Rusdin Maubere</i> , Case No. 23/2003, SPSC, 5 July 2004. | 523 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Vítor Manuel Alves</i> , Case No. 1/2002, SPSC, 8 July 2004. | 537 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Marculino Soares</i> , CaseNo2b/2002, SPSC, 1 December 2004 [Translation by the Editors]. | 545 |
| Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro and Miguel Angelo Lemos</i> | 560 |

12. Judgements

| | |
|--|-----|
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Metan</i> , Case No. 4c/2003, SPSC, 16 November 2004. | 573 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Lino Beno</i> , Case No. 4b/2003, SPSC, 16 November 2004. | 579 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Agostinho Cloe, Agostinho Cab, Lazarus Fuli and Antonio Lelan</i> , Case No. 4/2003, SPSC, 16 November 2004. | 587 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Anton Lela Sufa</i> , Case No. 4a/2003, SPSC, 25 November 2004. | 595 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Mateus Lao</i> , Case No. 10/2003, SPSC, 3 December 2004. | 605 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Alarico Mesquita, Florindo Morreira, Domingos Amati, Fransisco Matos, Laurindo da Costa, Laurencio Tavares, Mateus Guterres and Angelino da Costa</i> , Case No. 28/2003, SPSC. 6 December 2004. | 611 |
| Commentary <i>Masha Fedorova</i> | 629 |

13. Judgements

| | |
|--|-----|
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Florenco Tacaqui</i> , Case No. 20/2001, SPSC, 9 December 2004. | 643 |
| Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Aprecio Guterres</i> , Case No. 18a/2003, SPSC, 28 February 2005. | 683 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos Amati and Francisco Matos</i> , Case No. 12/2003, SPSC, 28 February 2005. | 687 |
| Final Disposition. | 695 |
| Commentary <i>Goran Sluiter</i> | 698 |

14. Judgements

| | |
|---|-----|
| Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Domingos de Deus</i> , Case No. 2a/2004, SPSC, 12 April 2005. | 709 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Brigitte Schmid | 719 |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Francisco Pedro</i> , Case No. 1/2001, SPSC, 14 April 2005. | 721 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Julio Fernandes</i> , Case No. 25/2003, SPSC, 19 April 2005 [Translation by the Editors]. | 729 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Phillip Rapoza With Respect to the Sentence. | 743 |
| Final Judgment. <i>Prosecutor v. Rudolfo Alves Correia</i> , Case No. 27/2003, SPSC, 25 April 2005. | 745 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Commentary <i>Avril McDonald</i> | 758 |
| 15. Judgements | |
| Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Januario da Costa and Mateus Punef</i> , Case No. 22/2003, SPSC, 25 April 2005. | 765 |
| Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Francisco Pereira</i> , Case No. 34/2003, SPSC, 27 April 2005. | 781 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Phillip Rapoza. | 806 |
| Final Judgment. <i>Prosecutor v. Sisto Barros and Cesar Mendonca</i> , Case No. 1/2004, SPSC, 12 May 2005. | 813 |
| Commentary <i>Gregory S. McNeal</i> | 838 |
| 16. Appeals | |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2004/29), <i>Prosecutor v. Paulino de Jesus</i> , Case No. 6/2002, CoA, 4 November 2004. | 849 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2004/30), <i>Prosecutor v. Marcelino Soares</i> , Case No. 11/2003, CoA, 17 February 2005 [Translation by the Editors]. | 857 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2004/54), <i>Prosecutor v. Umbertus Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, CoA, 18 March 2005 [Translation by the Editors]. | 867 |
| Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2004/60), <i>Prosecutor v. Vítor Manuel Alves</i> , Case No. 1/2002, CoA. 26 April 2005 [Translation by the Editors]. | 875 |
| Commentary <i>Sergey Vasiliev</i> | 879 |
| Index | 925 |
| Contributors and Editors | 929 |