



# **Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals**

**V O L U M E**

**The Special Court for  
Sierra Leone 2003-2004**

**André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)**



intersentia

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>Preface by the editors</b> .....	<b>13</b>
<b>Preface by Justice Bankole Thompson</b> .....	<b>17</b>
 <b>Part 1/ Preliminary Matters</b>	
<b>1. Jurisdiction - legality of establishment</b>	
Decision on Constitutionality and Lack of Jurisdiction, <i>Prosecutor v. Kallon, Norman and Kamara</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2004-15-AR72(E), SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E) and SCSL-2004-16-AR72 (E), A. Ch, 13 March 2004. ....	19
Decision on Preliminary Motion on the Invalidity of the Agreement between the United Nations and the Government of Sierra Leone on the Establishment of the Special Court, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-AR72(E), A. Ch., 25 May 2004. ....	35
Decision on Preliminary Motion on Lack of Jurisdiction; Illegal Delegation of Jurisdiction by Sierra Leone. <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), A. Ch., 25 May 2004 ...	41
Decision on Preliminary Motion on Lack of Jurisdiction Materiae: Illegal Delegation of Powers by the United Nations, <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), 25 May 2004. . . .	45
Separate Opinion of Justice Robertson, <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), 25 May 2004. ....	53
Commentary <i>Robert Cryer</i> . ....	56
 <b>2. Jurisdiction - amnesty</b>	
Decision on Challenge to Jurisdiction: Lomé Accord Amnesty, <i>Prosecutor v. Kallon and Kamara</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2004-15-AR72(E) and SCSL-2004-16-AR72(E), A. Ch. 13 March 2004. . . . .	63
Decision on Lack of Jurisdiction / Abuse of Process: Amnesty provided by the Lomé Accord, <i>Prosecutor v. Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), A. Ch., 25 May 2004. ....	85
Separate Opinion of Justice Robertson. ....	87
Commentary <i>Kai Ambos</i> . ....	103
 <b>3. Jurisdiction - substantive criminal law</b>	
Decision on the Defence Preliminary Motion based on Lack of Jurisdiction: Command Responsibility. <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-08-PT, T. Ch., 15 October 2003_____	109
Written Reasons for the Trial Chamber's Oral Decision on the Defence Motion on Abuse of Process due to Infringement of Principles of <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and Non-Retroactivity as to Several Accounts, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch., 31 March 2004. ....	115

Commentary <i>Elies van Sliedregt</i> . . . . .	123
Decision on Preliminary Motion on Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Materiae</i> : Nature of the Armed Conflict, <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), A. Ch., 25 May 2004. . . . .	133
Commentary <i>Christine Byron</i> . . . . .	142
Decision on Preliminary Motion based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Child Recruitment), <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), A. Ch., 31 May 2004. . . . .	145
Separate Opinion of Justice Gelaga King . . . . .	161
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Robertson. . . . .	163
Commentary <i>Christine Byron</i> . . . . .	178
 <b>4. Jurisdiction - head of state immunity</b>	
Decision on Immunity from Jurisdiction, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-01-I, A. Ch., 31 May 2004. . . . .	187
Commentary <i>Claus Kress</i> . . . . .	202
 <b>5. Indictment</b>	
Decision and Order on the Defence Preliminary Motion for Defects in the Form of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-05-PT, T. Ch., 13 October 2003. . . . .	209
Annexure to the Decision and Order on Defence Preliminary Motion for Defects in the Form of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-05-PT, T. Ch. 13 October 2003. . . . .	220
Decision on Prosecution Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Ghao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 6 May 2004. . . . .	223
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Bankole Thompson, Presiding Judge of the Trial Chamber. . . . .	233
Decision on Prosecution Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch., 6 May 2004. . . . .	239
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Bankole Thompson, Presiding Judge of the Trial Chamber. . . . .	248
Decision on Prosecution Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch., 20 May 2004. . . . .	253
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pierre Boutet, 31 May 2004. . . . .	267
Commentary	
<i>Roelof</i>	
<i>Haveman</i> .....	277

Part 2/ *Procedural Matters*

6. Provisional release

Ruling on the Application for the Issue of a Writ of Habeas Corpus Filed by the Applicant, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-06-PT, T. Ch., 22 July 2003. . . . .	281
---	-----

Ruling on a Motion Applying for Bail or for Provisional Release Filed by the Applicant, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-06-PT, T. Ch., 22 July 2003. . . . .	289
--	-----

Decision on the Urgent Defence Application for Release from Provisional Detention, <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-11-PD, T. Ch., 21 November 2003. . . . .	297
Decision on the Motion by Morris Kallon for Bail, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 23 February 2004. . . . .	305
Decision on Application of Issa Sesay for Provisional Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 31 March 2004. . . . .	315
Fofana - Decision on Application for Bail pursuant to Rule 65, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 5 August 2004. . . . .	327
Decision on Appeal against the Decision of the Trial Chamber refusing the Application for Bail by Morris Kallon, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-AR65, A. Ch., 17 September 2004. . . . .	341
Commentary <i>Hákan Priman</i> . . . . .	345
 7. Joinder	
Decision and Order on Prosecution Motions for Joinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Brima, Kallon, Gbao, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2003-05-PT, SCSL-2003-06-PT, SCSL-2003-07-PT, SCSL-2003-09-PT, SCSL-2003-10-PT, SCSL-2003-13-PT, T. Ch., 27 January 2004. . . . .	355
Separate Opinion of Judge Benjamin Mutanga Itoe on the Nature and Legal Consequences of the Ruling in Favour of the Filing of Two Consolidated Indictments. . . . .	369
Decision and Order on Prosecution Motions for Joinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2003-08-PT, SCSL-2003-11-PT and SCSL-2003-12-PT, T. Ch., 27 January 2004. . . . .	375
Separate Opinion of Judge Benjamin Mutanga Itoe on the Nature and Legal Consequences of the Ruling in Favour of the Filing of Two Consolidated Indictments. . . . .	387
Commentary <i>James Cockayne</i> . . . . .	392
 8. Witnesses	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims and for Non-public Disclosure, <i>Prosecutor v. Kallon</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-07-PT, Judge Thompson, 23 May 2003. . . . .	401
Annex to the Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims and for Non-Public Disclosure: Orders for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims and for Non Public Disclosure. . . . .	407
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims and for Non-public Disclosure, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-09-PT, Judge Boutet, 10 October 2003. . . . .	411
Ruling on the Prosecution Motion for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims and for Non-Public Disclosure and Urgent Request for Interim Measures until Appropriate Protective Measures Are in Place, <i>Prosecutor v. Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-12-PT, T. Ch., 10 October 2003. . . . .	427

Table of Contents

Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Immediate Protective Measures for Witnesses and Victims, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-13-PT, T. Ch., 24 November 2003. . . . .	433
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Modification of Protective Measures for Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch., 5 July 2004. . . . .	445
Decision on Prosecution Request for Leave to Call Additional Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-T, T. Ch., 29 My 2004. . . . .	457
Order on An Application by the Prosecution to Hold a Closed Session Hearing of Witnesses TF2-082 and TF2-032, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 13 September 2004. . . . .	465
Commentary <i>Goran Sluiter</i> . . . . .	468
 9. Disclosure	
Decision on the Prosecution Motion to Allow Disclosure to the Registry and to Keep Disclosed Material under Seal until Appropriate Protective Measures Are in Place, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-05-PT, Judge Bankole Thompson, 17 April 2003. . . . .	477
Kanu - Decision on Defence Motion in respect of Santigie Borbor Kami for an Order under Rule 54 with respect to Release of Exculpatory Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch., 1 June 2004. . . . .	481
Decision on Motion to Compel the Production of Exculpatory Witness Statement, Witness Summaries and Materials pursuant to Rule 68, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 8 July 2004. . . . .	491
Sesay - Decision on Defence Motion for Disclosure pursuant to Rules 66 and 68 of the Rules, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-T, T. Ch., 9 July 2004. . . . .	499
Sesay - Decision on Defence Motion, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-T. T. Ch., 15 July 2004. . . . .	511
Decision on Disclosure of Witness Statements and Cross Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch., 16 July 2004. . . . .	517
Ruling on Oral Application for the Exclusion of "Additional" Statement for Witness TF1-060, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch., 23 July 2004. . . . .	527
Ruling on Oral Application for the Exclusion of Part of the Testimony of Witness TF1-199, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch., 26 July 2004. . . . .	533
Brima - Decision on Motion for Exclusion of Prosecution Witness Statements and Stay of Filing of Prosecution Statements, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch., 2 August 2004. . . . .	537
Commentary <i>Eric Iverson</i> . . . . .	544

## 10. Counsel, Effective Defence and Right to be Tried in one's Presence

Brima - Decision on Applicant's Motion against Denial by the Acting Principal Defender to Enter a Legal Service Contract for the Assignment of Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-16-PT, T. Ch., 6 May 2004. . . . .	551
Commentary <i>Guénaél Mettraux</i> . . . . .	572
Decision on the Application of Samuel Hinga Norman for Self Representation Under Article 17(4)(d) of the Statute of the Special Court, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 8 June 2004. . . . .	575
Consequential Order on Assignment and Role of Standby Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> . Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 14 June 2004. . . . .	583
Commentary <i>Guénaél Mettraux</i> . . . . .	587
Decision on Request by Samuel Hinga Norman for Additional Sources to Prepare his Defence, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch., 23 June 2004 . . .	591
Commentary <i>Guénaél Mettraux</i> . . . . .	596
Gbao - Decision on Application to Withdraw Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch., 6 July 2004. . . . .	597
Commentary <i>Guénaél Mettraux</i> . . . . .	601
Ruling on the Issue of the Refusal of the Third Accused, Augustine Gbao, to Attend Hearing of the Special Court for Sierra Leone on 7 July 2004 and Succeeding Days, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch., 12 July 2004. . . . .	603
Commentary <i>Guénaél Mettraux</i> . . . . .	607
11. Impartiality	
Decision on Preliminary Motion based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Judicial Independence), <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-14-AR72(E), A. Ch., 13 March 2004. . . . .	609
Separate Opinion of Justice Geoffrey Robertson. . . . .	617
Decision on Defence Motion seeking the Disqualification of Justice Robertson from the Appeals Chamber. <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-AR15, A. Ch., 13 March 2004. . . . .	627
Sesay - Decision on Defence Motion seeking Clarification of the Decision on the Disqualification of Justice Robertson from the Appeals Chamber, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, A. Ch., 25 May 2004. . . . .	633
Decision on the Motion to Recuse Judge Winter from the Deliberation in the Preliminary Motion on the Recruitment of Child Soldiers, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, A. Ch., 28 May 2004. . . . .	635
Commentary <i>Salvatore Zappalá</i> . . . . .	642

**12. Decisions concerning an expeditious trial**

Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Concurrent Hearing of Evidence Common to Cases SCSL-2004-15-PT and SCSL-2004-16-PT, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 11 May 2004. . . . . 649

Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa*, Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch., 2 June 2004. . . . . 659

Annex I to the Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence . . . . . 667

Annex II to the Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence . . . . . 669

Decision on Co-operation between the Parties, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 16 June 2004. . . . . 673

Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 24 June 2004. . . . . 677

Annex I . . . . . 687

Annex II . . . . . 688

Commentary *Daniel Ntanda Nsereko*. . . . . 690

**13. Relation with the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and National Authorities**

Decision on the Request by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Sierra Leone to Conduct a Public Hearing with Samuel Hinga Norman, *Prosecutor v. Norman*, Case No. SCSL-2003-08-PT, T. Ch.. 29 October 2003. . . . . 699

Decision on Appeal by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission for Sierra Leone ("TRC" or "the Commission") and Chief Samuel Hinga Norman JP against the Decision of His Lordship, Mr Justice Bankole Thompson Delivered on 30 October 2003 to Deny the TRC's Request to Hold a Public Hearing with Chief Samuel Hinga Norman JP, *Prosecutor v. Norman*, Case No. SCSL-2003-08-PT. Justice Robertson, President, 28 November 2003. . . . . 707

Decision on Appeal by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission ("TRC") and Accused against the Decision of Judge Bankole Thompson Delivered on 3 November 2003 to Deny The TRC's Request to Hold a Public Hearing with Augustine Gbao, *Prosecutor v. Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT. Justice Renate Winter, Acting President, 7 May 2004. . . . . 723

Commentary *Andre Klip*. . . . . 726

Norman - Decision on *inter Partes* Motion by Prosecution to Freeze the Account of the Accused Sam Hinga Norman at Union Trust Bank (SL) or at Any Other Bank in Sierra Leone, *Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa*, Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, T. Ch., 19 April 2004. . . . . 733

Commentary *Andre Klip*. . . . . 741

**14. Conditions of Detention**

Order for Physiological and Psychiatric Examination and Detention on Remand, *Prosecutor v. Sankoh*, Case No. SCSL-2003-02-1, Judge Benjamin Mutanga Itoe, 15 March 2003. . . . . 743

Order for Further Physiological and Psychiatric Examination, *Prosecutor v. Sankoh*, Case No. SCSL-2003-02-I, Judge Benjamin Mutanga Itoe, 21 March 2003. . . . . 745

Ruling on the Motion for a Stay of Proceedings Filed by the Applicant, <i>Prosecutor v. Sankoh</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-02-PT, T. Ch., 22 July 2003. . . . .	747
Decision on Motion for Modification of the Conditions of Detention, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-08-PT, Justice Robertson, President, 26 November 2003. . . . .	755
Decision Prohibiting Communications and Visits, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-08-PT, Registry, 20 January 2004. . . . .	761
Decision on Motion to Reverse the Order of the Registrar under Rule 48(C) of the Rules of Detention. <i>Prosecutor v. Norman</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-PT, Justice Renate Winter, Acting President, 18 May 2004. . . . .	765
Commentary <i>Gerard de Jonge</i> . . . . .	769
<b>15. Right to Appeal</b>	
Decision on the Applications for a Stay of Proceedings and Denial of Right to Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Cases No. SCSL-2003-08-PT, SCSL-2003-07-PT, SCSL-2003-09-PT, A. Ch., 4 November 2003. . . . .	775
Separate Opinion of Judge King. . . . .	784
Decision on Prosecution's Application for Leave to File an Interlocutory Appeal against the Decision on the Prosecution's Motions for Joinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-PT, T. Ch., 13 February 2004 *. . . . .	787
Decision on Prosecution Application for Leave to File an Interlocutory Appeal against Decision on Motion for Concurrent Hearing of Evidence Common to Cases SCSL-2004-15-PT and SCSL-2004-16-PT. <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, T. Ch., 1 June 2004. . . . .	793
Kallon - Decision on Application for Leave to Appeal against Refusal of Bail, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-PT, A. Ch., 23 June 2004. . . . .	799
Sesay - Decision on Application for Leave to Appeal against Refusal of Bail, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> . Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, A. Ch., 28 July 2004. . . . .	805
Majority Decision on the Prosecution's Application for Leave to File an Interlocutory Appeal against the Decision on the Prosecution's Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment against Samuel Hinga Norman, Moinina Fofana and Allieu Kondewa, <i>Prosecutor v. Norman, Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, T. Ch., 2 August 2004. . . . .	809
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pierre Boutet on Decision on the Prosecution's Application for Leave to File an Interlocutory Appeal against the Decision on the Prosecution's Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment against Samuel Hinga Norman, Moinina Fofana and Allieu Kondewa. . . . .	812
Decision on Application for Leave to Appeal Gbao-Decision on Application to Withdraw Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004-15-T, T. Ch., 4 August 2004. . . . .	825
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Thompson on Decision on Application for Leave to Appeal Gbao - Application to Withdraw Counsel, 7 September 2004. . . . .	841
Commentary <i>Chiseche Mibenge</i> . . . . .	844



*Table of Contents*

Index .....	849
Contributors and Editors. ....	853