



V O L U M E

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

The International
Criminal Tribunal
for Rwanda 2000-2001

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
 Part 1/ Preliminary Matters	
1. Indictment	
Decision on the Defence Motions Objecting to the Jurisdiction of the Trial Chamber on the Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-12-I, T. Ch. III, 13 April 2000.	13
Decision on the Defence Motions Objecting to a Lack of Jurisdiction and Seeking to Declare the Indictment Void Ab Initio, <i>Prosecutor v. Kabiligi and Ntabakuze</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-34-I, T. Ch. III, 13 April 2000	19
Decision on Prosecutor's Request for Leave to File an Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Niyitegeka</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-1, T. Ch. II, 21 June 2000.	27
Decision on Defence Motion on Matters Arising from Trial Chamber Decisions and Preliminary Motion Based on Defects in the Form of the Indictment and Lack of Jurisdiction, <i>Prosecutor v. Niyitegeka</i> . Case No. ICTR-96-14-T, T. Ch. II, 20 November 2000.	39
Commentary <i>Daniel Ntanda Nsereko</i>	49
 2. Joinder of Cases	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Joinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> . Cases No. ICTR-96-7, ICTR-97-34, ICTR-97-30, ICTR-96-12, T. Ch. III, 29 June 2000.	59
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Joinder of Accused and on the Prosecutor's Motion for Severance of the Accused, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-1. T. Ch. II, 29 June 2000.	77
Decision on the Defence Motion in Opposition to Joinder and Motion for Severance and Separate Trial Filed by the Accused Juvenal Kajelijeli, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimana, Karemera, Nzabonimana, Rwamakuba, Kahuga, Ngirumpatse, Nzirorera and Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. II, 6 July 2000.	85
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Joinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicomumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera and Rwamakuba</i> . Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-54-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Nixiiegeka</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-T, T. Ch. II, 6 July 2000.	93
Decision on the Defence Motion seeking a Separate Trial for the Accused Sylvain Nsabimana, <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana, Ntezirivayo, Nyiramasuhuko, Ntahobali, Kanyabashi and Ndayambaje</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-29A-T, T. Ch. II, 8 September 2000.	105
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice and Presumptions of Facts Pursuant to Rules 94 and 54. <i>Prosecutor v. Semanza</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-I, T. Ch. III, 3 November 2000 . . .	113

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion to Join the Indictments ICTR-96-10-I and ICTR-96-17-T, *Prosecutor v. E. Ntakirutimana, G. Ntakirutimana and Sikubwaho*, Cases No. ICTR-96-10-I and ICTR-96-17-T. T. Ch. I, 22 February 2001.127

Commentary *Greg Lombardi*.134

Part UProcedural Matters

3. Habeas Corpus

Decision on the Defence Motion Concerning the Arbitrary Arrest and Illegal Detention of the Accused and on the Defence Notice of Urgent Motion to Expand and Supplement the Record of 8 December 1999 Hearing, *Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. II, 8 May 2000.143

Decision on the *Defence* Extremely Urgent Motion on Habeas Corpus and for Stoppage of Proceedings, *Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi*, Case No. ICTR-96-15-I, T. Ch. II, 23 May 2000.153

Decision, *Semanza v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-97-23-A, A. Ch., 31 May 2000.167

Declaration of Judge Lai Chand Vohrah.191

Declaration of Judge Rafael Nieto-Navia.194

Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen.195

Decision on the Defence Motion Concerning the Illegal Arrest and Illegal Detention of the Accused- *Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba and others*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. II, 12 December 2000.207

Commentary *Geen-Jan Knoops*.216

Decision (Prosecutor's Request for Review or Reconsideration), *Barayagwiza v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-97-14-AR72, A. Ch., 31 March 2000.223

Declaration of Judge Lai Chand Vohrah.238

Declaration of Judge Rafael Nieto-Navia.239

Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen.245

Commentary *William Schabas*.261

4. Right to Counsel

Decision on Review in Terms of Article 19(E) of the Directive on Assignment of Defence Counsel, *Prosecutor i. Barayagwiza*, Case No. ICTR-97-19-I, President ICTR, 19 January 2000 . . .267

Decision (Request for Withdrawal of Defence Counsel), *Barayagwiza v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-97-19-AR72. A. Ch., 31 January 2000.269

Presidents Review of the Decision of the Registrar in Terms of Article 12 of the Directive on the Assignment of Defence Counsel, *Rutaganda v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-96-3-A, President ICTR. 7 July 2000.273

Decision on Registry's Request for Reconsideration of Ruling dated 7 July 2000, *Rutaganda v. Prosecutor*. Case No. ICTR-96-3-A, President ICTR, 13 July 2000.277

Decision on Defence Counsel Motion to Withdraw, <i>Prosecutor v. Barayagwiza</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-19-T, T. Ch. I, 2 November 2000."	279
Concurring and Separate Opinion of Judge Gunawardana.	284
Decision on the Accused's Request for Withdrawal of his Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngeze</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-27-I, T. Ch. I, 29 March 2001.	287
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Gunawardana on the Accused's Request for Withdrawal of his Counsel. 28 March 2001.	292
Commentary <i>Tarn Spronken</i>	296
 5. Witnesses and Admission of Evidence	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Orders for Protective Measures for Victims and Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagambiki and Imanishimwe</i> , Cases No. ICTR-97-36-I and 36-T, T. Ch. ID, 3 March 2000.	303
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Orders for Protective Measures for Victims and Witnesses. <i>Prosecutor v. Muhimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1B-I, T. Ch. III, 9 March 2000.	309
Decision on the Defence's Request for Measures of Investigation with Regard to Certain Prosecution Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-11-T, T. Ch. I, 7 November 2000.	313
Decision on Pauline Nyiramasuhuko's Motion for Protective Measures for Defence Witnesses and Their Family Members. <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 20 March 2001."	315
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Protective Measures for Victims and Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor w Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 27 March 2001	321
Decision on Arsene Shalom Ntahobali's Motion for Protective Measures for Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali.</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 3 April 2001	329
Decision on the Defence Motion for Exclusion of Evidence on the Basis of Violations of the Rules of Evidence. <i>Res Gestae</i> , Hearsay and Violations of the Statute and Rules of the Tribunal, <i>Prosecutor v. Seman:a</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-I, T. Ch. III, 23 August 2000.	335
Commentary <i>Hans Nijboer</i>	338
 6. Disclosure	
Decision on the Request of the Defence for an Order for Service of a United Nations Memorandum. Prepared by Michael Hourigan, Former ICTR Investigator, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagilishema</i> . Case No. ICTR-95-1A-T, T. Ch. I, 8 June 2000.	343
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Mehmet Güney.	348
Decision on the Defence Motion for Disclosure of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 8 September 2000.	351
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Güney to the Decision on the Defence Motion for Disclosure of Evidence.	354

Decision on Semanza's Motion for Subpoenas, Depositions, and Disclosure, *Prosecutor v. Sefnanza*, Case No. ICTR-97-20-I, T. Ch. III, 20 October 2000. 357

Decision on Defence Motion for Disclosure of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahoball* Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 1 November 2000. 365

Commentary *Bruce Zcigaris*. 375

7. Right to and Scope of Appeal

Decision Rejecting Notice of Appeal, *Kanyabashi v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-96-15-A, A. Ch., 21 January 2000. 381

Order, *Kajelijeti v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR72, A. Ch., 10 August 2000. 389

Decision on the Interlocutory Appeals, *Ngez,e and Nahimana v. Prosecutor*, Cases No. ICTR-97-27AR72 and 96-11-AR72, A. Ch., 5 September 2000. 391

Joint Separate Opinion of Judge Lai Chand Vohrah and Judge Rafael Nieto-Navia 395

Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen. 401

Commentary *Stacy Cummings*. 411

8. Relations to National Jurisdictions

Decision on the Detence Motion for Additional Protective Measures for Defence Witnesses, *Prosecutor v. Ntagerura*, Case No. ICTR-96-10-I, T. Ch. III, 4 February 2000. 417

Separate Opinion of Judge Yakov Ostrovsky. 421

Decision on the Detence Motion Challenging the Legality of the Arrest and Detention of the Accused and Requesting the Return of Personal Items Seized, *Prosecutor v. Nzirorera*, Case No. ICTR-9H-44-T. T. Ch- II. 7 September 2000. 423

Decision on the Defence Motion for Exclusion of Evidence and Restitution of Property Seized, *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko*, Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 12 October 2000. 431

Commentary *M it sue inazumi*.....437

9. Contempt of Court

Decision on the Defence Motion for the Interpretation of Rules 89(A), (B), (C), (D), and 90(F) and (G) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence and for the Recall of a Witness, *Prosecutor v. SemanzcL* Case No. ICTR-97-20-I, T. Ch. III, 1 December 2000. 445

Decision on Two Defence Motions pursuant to, *inter alia*, Rule 5 of the Rules and the Prosecutor's Motion for Extension of Time to File the Modified Amended Indictment pursuant to the Trial Chamber II Order of 20 November 2000 - Warning to the Prosecutor's Counsel Pursuant to Rule 46 (A), *Prosecutor v. Niyitegeka*, Case No. ICTR-96-14-T, T. Ch. II, 27 February 2001. 449

Commentary *Chrisje Brants*. 458

Part 3/ Judgement and Sentencing**10. Judgements**

Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Musema</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-13-T, T. Ch. I, 27 January 2000	469
Separate Opinion of Judge Aspegren	602
Separate Opinion of Judge Pillay	608
Commentary <i>Ruth Kok</i>	614
Judgment, <i>Semghago v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-39-A, A. Ch., 14 February 2000	625
Reasons for Judgment, <i>Serushago v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-39-A, A. Ch., 6 April 2000	627
Commentary <i>Kai Ambos</i>	635
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruggiu</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-32-I, T. Ch. I, 1 June 2000	637
Commentary <i>M'uhilc Bateau</i>	651
Judgement, <i>kambwida v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-23-A, A. Ch., 19 October 2000.	659
Commentary <i>Jan Christoph Nemitz</i>	681
Index	687
Contributors and Editors	691